
World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA7032
Printed On: 12/15/2022

Reporting Period: 02/23/2018 to 06/15/2022
Report Type: Completion Report
Status: Approved

Assignment: TFOA7032

Third Grant for Colombia Readiness Preparation Proposal (Readiness Fund of Forest Carbon Partnership Facility)

FCPF - Forest Carbon Partnership Facility

Task Team Leader: 00000242041- Julian Lee
Approving Manager: 00000226603- Genevieve Connors

Summary Information	
TF Status	ACTV
Recipient Country	Colombia
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	9272 - SLCEN
Grant Start Date / End Date	02/23/2018 to 06/15/2022
Original Grant Amount	4,930,000.00
Grant Amount	4,930,000.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	3,913,396.05 as of 06/15/2022
Disbursed 02/23/2018 to 06/15/2022	3,913,396.05
Donor	TFOA7032 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Components, Outcome, Execution, Program (FCPFR), Disbursements.

Ref. TF0A7032
 Printed On: 1512/15/2022

Reporting Period: 02/23/2018 to 06/15/2022
 Report Type: Completion Report
 Status: Approved

OVERVIEW

Overall Assessments

Grant Objectives:

The objective of the grant is to strengthen enabling conditions for implementation of the National REDD+ Strategy.

Overall progress from 02/23/2018 to 06/15/2022 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

Comment:

The project achieved significant progress against its Project Development Objective (PDO), fully achieving the targets of three of its five PDO-level indicators. However, progress against two of the PDO-level indicators was only partial. As a result, project performance is rated as **Moderately Satisfactory**.

PDO indicators Fully Achieved:

1. *REDD+ and regional REDD+ implementation plans have been developed and finalized in consultation with various sectors and stakeholders in four Zonas Futuro (Catatumbo, Bajo Cauca, Chiribiquete and Pacifico Narinense)*. This indicator reflected the contribution of the grant to the definition of a deforestation control strategy in each of the four selected areas and provision of inputs to guide other interventions for the conservation, restoration, and forest management. By the closing date and as expected, the National REDD+ Strategy (*Estrategia Integral de Control a la Deforestación y Gestión de Bosques -EICDGB*) and four regional strategies were completed for areas with high rates of deforestation and prioritized for the implementation of the 2016 Havana Peace Agreement.

2. *National and regional stakeholder participation platforms operational*. The indicator reflected the support for stakeholder involvement as part of strengthening the enabling conditions for implementation of the EICDGB (launched in 2018). Nine regional and two national stakeholder platforms were either strengthened or created and made operational (operational status was measured based on frequency of meeting -at least twice a year- and stakeholder representation).

Since the finalization of the EICDGB, with the support of this grant, Colombia continuously engaged in numerous multi-stakeholder consultations on REDD+. At the national level, two sessions were conducted for the National REDD+ Forum (*Mesa Nacional REDD+*) and multiple sessions of the National Environmental Indigenous Commission (*Comisión Nacional Ambiental Indígena - CNAI*), and at the regional level multiple sessions of the Afro-Colombian roundtable (*Mesa Ambiental y de Derechos del Pueblo Negro*), the Regional Amazon Indigenous roundtable (*Mesa Regional Amazónica*), the Regional Andean-Amazon roundtable (*Mesa Paro Andino-Amazónica*), the women's roundtable (*Plataforma de Mujeres*); additional sessions for the dialogue platform of the Atrato River (*Mesa del Río Atrato para el cumplimiento de la Sentencia de la Corte Suprema de Justicia T622*), and dialogue spaces for the consolidation of four Regional Centers of Environmental Dialogue (*Centros Regionales de Diálogo Ambiental -CRDA*) for the Amazon, Pacific, Caribbean and Andes regions. These participation platforms were strengthened or created and put in motion with main representatives of the local communities and ethnic peoples, the public and private sector, smallholder farmers, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), academia, and international cooperation agencies.

3. *The Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) completed country-wide, and a National Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) prepared*. This indicator gave continuity to the SESA process in the regions of the Caribbean, Andes, Pacific, and Amazon Regions that was started with support of the second FCPF grant, while also continuing the preparation of the ESMF. By closing, both documents had been finished and updated, accompanied by the formulation of the Indigenous Peoples Framework (IPPF) and the Process Framework (PF). All documents received the non-objection of the Bank.

PDO Indicators partially achieved:

4. *An action plan on deforestation and forest management, including a baseline of the territorial, social and environmental conflicts, was agreed among the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development (MinAmbiente), indigenous organizations, and local communities*. This indicator reflected long-time commitments between MinAmbiente and the Indigenous Peoples (IPs) and the need to develop a comprehensive proposal, based on consultations with indigenous and rural communities at the national and territorial levels, to strengthen environmental governance in the territories. The goal was to provide an analytical basis to address socio-environmental conflicts related to deforestation and forest management. At closing, the project had prepared an advanced draft of the plan while awaiting MinAmbiente's approval for hiring a consultant to finalize the formulation. However, the procurement process for the consultant could not be finalized on time, while security issues, social unrest, and the temporary disruption of relationships between the Government and the IPs between 2019 and 2021, affected the achievement of this indicator.

5. *Incorporation of the REDD+ National Safeguard Information System (SIS) within the National Environmental Information System (SIAC).* This indicator reflected the commitment for continued support to the implementation of the National Safeguard Information System and its inclusion and operation through the National Environmental Information System. At closing, the SIS was not fully finished or in operation, nor was it therefore incorporated into the SIAC. The project did design a prototype of the SIS with a preliminary proposal for its structure. This prototype was not finished due to delays in the hiring of four professionals to support the Information and Technology office of MinAmbiente. The SIS still needs to be developed to monitor compliance with safeguards at the different levels of REDD+ implementation at the national, subnational (programs) and local levels (projects). This system requires an urgent institutional commitment since it is a cross-cutting issue for implementing all aspects of REDD+. This should therefore be a priority when moving forward and will require establishing institutional arrangements and developing capacities at national, regional, and local levels.

Beyond working to achieve these five PDO indicators, the grant strengthened other aspects that will contribute to enabling conditions for implementation of the EICDGB. These include policies and legislation; REDD+ intervention models; and community-driven monitoring.

On forest legislation and policies, the grant supported the development of the National Policy for the Control of Deforestation and Sustainable Forest Management (CONPES 4021), the National Policy for the National Protected Areas System (CONPES 4050), regulations for operation of the national council for deforestation control (*Consejo Nacional de Lucha contra la Deforestación-CONALDEF*), Decree 690 of 2021 that regulates the sustainable management of wild flora and non-timber forest products, Roadmap and information protocols for MinAmbiente to comply with its commitments under the Sentence of the Court 4360 of 2018 on the protection of the Amazon rainforest, and a law analysis for the regulation of Chapter 4 of Law 170 of 1993, on the "Use of land and protection of natural resources and the environment" by afro-Colombian peoples in the Pacific region.

Eight REDD+ intervention models, were designed with and by local communities in the Pacific, the Sierra Nevada de Santa Marta, Northern Andes, Catatumbo, and Amazon regions. These models designed an intervention pathway to control deforestation, ensuring sustainable use of forests and providing a livelihood for those communities that live and depend upon forests, aligned with local social, cultural, economic, and environmental conditions. The models by region were the following: Pacific region: (i) Women providers of life and wellbeing (*Mujeres paridoras de vida y bienestar*), with the objective of developing a strategy to improve the food security and sovereignty of the women of the community afro-Colombian councils of Acapa, Bajo Mira and Frontera, Cortina Verde Nelson Mandela and Rio Rosario in Tumaco and Francisco Pizarro municipalities; (ii) Forest conservation strategy in the community afro-Colombian councils of Yurumangui and Mayorquin (*Estrategia de conservación de bosques en los consejos comunitarios de Yurumangui y Mayorquin*), strategy for sustainable use of land based forests and mangroves to reduce forest degradation, and the establishment of conservation agreements among the councils members to make an efficient use of wood for cooking; (iii) Sustainable Forest Management (*Manejo Sostenible del Bosque - union natural*), development of capacities to strengthen the forestry value chain of the community council of the *Asociación Campesina Integral del Atrato* (COCOMACIA); (iv) Agricultural productive systems linked to the sustainable management of forests, complementary to the third intervention model, this contributed with the design of a capacity building strategy for the restauration of soils in degraded areas by agriculture in COCOMACIA; (v) Remediation, rehabilitation and/or restauration of degraded areas due to mining in the Quito river basin (*Remediación, rehabilitación y/o restauración de zonas degradadas por minería en los bosques de la cuenca del Río Quito*), formulation of a protocol for the remediation, rehabilitation or restauration of forest areas degraded by mining, as part of the commitments of the Court Sentence T-622; Caribbean region: (vi) Natural regeneration strategy and incentives for the Arhuaco people in the Sierra Nevada de Santa Marta (*Estrategia de regeneración natural e incentivos del pueblo Arhuaco de la Sierra*), roadmap for a community-driven strategy to implement restoration and regeneration initiatives in the Sierra; Northern Andes region: (vii) Management and harvesting plan for community forestry nucleus (*Plan de Manejo y de corta en núcleo de forestería comunitaria*, design of a forestry plan for 355 hectares of natural forests in the municipalities of Segovia and Remedios (Antioquia) and Montecristo (Bolívar); Catatumbo region: (viii) Differential agroecological model of the Catatumbo Bari people (*Modelo agroecológico diferencial del pueblo Catatumbo Bari*), for the conservation of forest, the control of deforestation and for food security within the Catatumbo Bari Indigenous Reserve in overlap with the National Natural Park Catatumbo, by the implementation of cacao agroforestry arrangements.

Complementary to the models, the grant provided support to the Directorate of Forests, Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services of MinAmbiente for the identification and mapping of financial mechanisms and incentives to boost the forest economy and other productive alternatives in deforestation hotspots; the formulation of pathways for the creation of new and complementary financial mechanisms; and technical inputs for the development of the National Program of Community Forestry for Sustainable Forest Management. However, support to develop three regional Payment for Environmental Services (PES) Programs did not yield its intended results, as the only evidence provided by the government are four models of voluntary agreements signed between two regional authorities and one NGO and local communities for the payment of incentives for restoration of private land, falling short of the government's own requirements for PES Program.

The National Forest and Carbon Monitoring System (*Sistema de Monitoreo de Bosques y Carbono - SMByC*) generates reliable and robust information and reports. It has options for improvement and innovation, integrating information from participatory community monitoring schemes that allow gathering information at the local level and generating capacities in the territory, in addition to integrating other methodologies. The project developed six community-driven monitoring pilots that now are under implementation by local communities together with the national institutions (Institute of Hydrology, Meteorology and Environmental Studies-IDEAM) and contributed to closing the information gap between the national system and the territories by integrating local communities into the system and providing transparency and inclusion.

Overall progress from 02/23/2018 to 06/15/2022 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

Comment:

This third Additional Funding (TF0A7032) was approved on February 23, 2018, and became effective on May 7, 2018, while the second grant (TF018501) was still under implementation (Closing January 30, 2019). The project faced three sets of structural implementation challenges:

First, after three months of implementation, a new national government took office on August 7, 2018. The new authorities immediately initiated a review of the ministry's portfolio and a restructuring of its workplan, placing on hold new activities, including those of the project. The new government began preparing its 2018-2022 National Development Plan and wanted to align the REDD+ Strategy with its new priorities. Thus, MinAmbiente did not sign off on the 2019 Annual Operations Plan until June 2019, six months after the end of the second FCPF grant and 11 months after effectiveness. This delay also implied that the project implementation unit had to be reconstituted, and a new coordinator was hired only in January 2020. Cumulatively, these delays resulted in the loss of some 18 months of implementation time. In addition, departmental and municipal elections in January 2020 required renewed coordination and communications with new local authorities to review planned activities and ensure their engagement.

Second, these delays were then compounded by the COVID-19 emergency: The government of Colombia declared a national State of Economic, Social and Ecological Emergency from March 12, 2020 to June 30, 2022, imposing restrictions on the mobility of people, which caused significantly delays in time and financial execution. In addition, a change of minister and vice-ministers in October 2020 at MinAmbiente generated substantial turnover of key ministry decision-makers and counterparts, causing delays in the approval of the 2021 Annual Work Plan and the definition of procurement priorities. Finally, the project coordinator first appointed in January 2020 was changed in November 2020 and again in May 2021.

Finally, during implementation, the value of the Colombian peso against the US dollar declined substantially, with additional effects on project execution. This resulted in a surplus of approximately COP \$3.5 billion (US\$ 1 million), increasing the available budget in local currency by some 28 percent from COP \$14.05 billion at appraisal to COP 17.6 billion at closing. As a combined result of this, the abovementioned delays, and in the face of the impossibility of extending the project closing date due to the closing of the FCPF trust fund, financial execution at project closing was 79 percent.

Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of the Grant:

The Republic of Colombia is a participant of the FCPF and has received a total of three grants. The first grant for a total amount of US\$ 200,000 was approved in October 2010 for the purpose of formulating the Readiness Preparation Proposal (R-PP), which was successfully completed in 2013. The R-PP identified the necessary interventions to strengthen Colombia's technical and institutional capacities to participate in a future REDD+ mechanism. The overall financial envelope needed for achieving REDD+ Readiness in Colombia was estimated at US\$ 27.5 million. The FCPF Participants Committee approved Colombia's R-PP in November 2013 and granted Colombia a US\$3.6 million Readiness Preparation grant. However, the grant agreement was only signed on April 29, 2015, resulting from a need to hold initial consultation workshops before formally allocating the grant, and subsequently a need to clarify the legal and fiduciary arrangements among the World Bank, MinAmbiente and Fondo Acción, the executing entity. The second Readiness Grant was completed on January 30, 2019. Colombia's request for additional FCPF funding of US\$ 4.93 million in the form of a third grant was approved on March 29, 2017, during the 23rd Meeting of the FCPF Participant Committee and closed activities on June 15, 2022.

The purpose of the third grant was to consolidate achievements under the second grant and strengthen the capacity of Colombia's transition from REDD+ Readiness to REDD+ implementation. The grant financed costs associated with scaling up and expanding **Component 1** (Organization, Consultation and Participation) by strengthening ongoing participatory processes, and building the capacity of the indigenous and Afro-Colombian population, civil society and forestry sector organizations, thus increasing their engagement in the REDD+ process; **Component 2** (REDD+ Strategy Implementation) by creating appropriate conditions at an institutional, technical and operative levels to enable the implementation of the REDD+ Strategy to halt deforestation in active deforestation hotspots; and added a new **Component 3** (National Monitoring Systems for Forests and Safeguards) for continuing the establishment of a robust national forest monitoring system by implementing a protocol for community monitoring that strengthens tracking the drivers and agents of deforestation; and establishing a Safeguards Information System. With this grant, the Project Development Objective (PDO) was modified, given the expanded scope of REDD+ readiness interventions.

Colombia presented its REDD+ Readiness Package (R-Package) to the 31st Participants Committee meeting of the FCPF on October 18-20, 2022. Colombia was praised for its progress towards REDD+ readiness, as demonstrated in its R-Package and the work it has carried out under the Green Climate Fund (GCF) and REDD Early Movers (REM) programs. The PC was particularly impressed by the institutional strengthening and implementation of REDD+ in the Amazon region and welcomed Colombia's intention to develop an agenda to regulate voluntary carbon markets and integrate Article 6 of the Paris Agreement in their national legislation in the future. The Participants Committee approved Colombia's R-Package through Resolution PC/31/2022/2.

Expected follow up (if any): The FCPF Participants Committee requested Colombia to give an official response to the findings of the Technical Advisor Panel (TAP) Report, as well as the government's plans to improve those criteria that require additional work to continue strengthening REDD+ readiness and subsequent implementation. This response is expected to be delivered to the World Bank by December 31, 2022.

Comment on follow up: N/A

End Date of Last Site Visit: A virtual implementation support mission was carried out under COVID travel restrictions from November 30 to December 1, 2021.

Grant Restructuring: A first restructuring took place on June 24, 2020, by request of the recipient, and included an extension of the original closing date from June 30, 2020, to December 31, 2021, to accommodate start-up delays as well as changes to the results framework. A second restructuring was approved on October 5, 2021, and included an extension of the closing date for five and a half months (until June 15, 2022).

OUTCOME

Comments on outcome achieved from 02/23/2018 to 06/15/2022

Grant Outcome Indicators

1. REDD+ and regional REDD+ implementation plans have been developed and finalized in consultation with various sectors and stakeholders in four Zonas Futuro (Catatumbo, Bajo Cauca, Chiribiquete and Pacifico Narinense)

Baseline Value: 1 National REDD+ strategy

Date: 02/23/2018

Progress to Date: 1 National REDD+ Strategy and 4 regional REDD+ plans formulated (Catatumbo, Bajo Cauca, Chiribiquete, and Pacifico Narinense).

Date: 06/15/2022

Target Value: 1 national and 4 regional implementation plans formulated

Date: 06/15/2022

2. National and regional stakeholder participation platforms operational

Baseline Value: 1 national and 4 regional stakeholder participation platforms operational

Date: 02/23/2018

Progress to Date: National stakeholder participation platforms: National REDD+ Forum (*Mesa Nacional REDD+*) and National environmental Indigenous Commission (*Comisión Nacional Ambiental Indígena - CNAI*); Regional stakeholder participation platforms: Afro-Colombian round table (*Mesa Ambiental y de Derechos del Pueblo Negro*), the Regional Amazon Indigenous roundtable (*Mesa Regional Amazonica*), the Regional Andean-Amazon roundtable (*Mesa Paro Andino-Amazónica*), the women's roundtable (*Plataforma de Mujeres*); platform of the Atrato River (*Mesa del Río Atrato para el cumplimiento de la Sentencia de la Corte Suprema de Justicia T622*), and four Regional Centers of Environmental Dialogue (*Centros Regionales de Dialogo Ambiental -CRDA*) for the Amazon, Pacific, Caribbean and Andes regions.

Date: 06/15/2022

Target Value: 2 national and 9 regional platforms operational

Date: 06/15/2022

3. The Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) completed country-wide and a National Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) prepared

Baseline Value: National SESA completed. ESMF under finalization.

Date: 02/23/2018

Progress to Date: National SESA updated and ESMF finalized. In addition, the Indigenous Peoples Framework and the Process Framework formulated.

Date: 06/15/2022

Target Value: National SESA and ESMF completed

Date: 06/15/2022

4. An action plan on deforestation and forest management, including a baseline of the territorial, social and environmental conflicts, is agreed between the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development, indigenous organizations, and local communities

Baseline Value: No action plan including a baseline of territorial, social, and environmental conflicts.

Date: 02/23/2018

Progress to Date: Action plan developed but not agreed yet between the MinAmbiente, indigenous organizations, and local communities. Security issues and disagreements among the parties have delayed this process.

Date: 06/15/2022

Target Value: Action plan including baseline for territorial conflicts, developed, and agreed between the Ministry, indigenous organizations, and local communities.

Date: 06/15/2022

5. Incorporation of the REDD+ Safeguard Information System (SIS) within the National Environmental Information System (SIAC).

Baseline Value: No integration REDD+ national safeguards information system (SIS) within the Environmental Information System of Colombia (SIAC).

Date: 02/23/2018

Progress to Date: Progress was made in the strengthening of structural elements, such as the update of the national safeguards' interpretation and advances at the technical level in the early design and implementation pathways for the SIS. However, delays in the procurement of the technical team to support the integration of the REDD+ SIS and SIAC resulted in this indicator not being achieved.

Date: 06/15/2022

Target Value: Integration of REDD+ SIS within SIAC

Date: 06/15/2022



COMPONENTS

Output and Implementation by Component

Component 1: Organization, Consultation and Participation

Status:	Partially completed
Planned Output:	Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM), capacity building plan and communications strategy fully implemented nationwide; national, regional and intersectoral deforestation control coordination mechanisms and platforms strengthened. Generation of inputs to inform deforestation control, forest management and biodiversity conservation public policies.
Actual Output:	GRM - Citizen Attention Mechanism (MAC) (not finished). The grant provided technical support for the prioritization and provision of REDD+ information in native languages, improvement of the clarity of the language used to provide REDD+ information, characterization of REDD+ users to improve channels of communications and strengthening considerations for people with disabilities. However, these elements have not been integrated in the existing GRM, which therefore cannot be considered to be fully operational. A capacity building plan (finished) was developed. Some activities of the plan have been implemented, such as the virtual course on “Community Forest Management and restoration of forest landscapes” in which 178 people participated; workshops and participatory spaces with 1782 participants (464 women) were held with Afro-Colombian, indigenous and rural communities to develop a collective vision of forests and strengthen tools for territorial governance and their involvement in forest governance in their local economies; three trainings took place for community representatives located in areas with the highest deforestation rates on community forest management, sustainable wood trading, and furniture making. The community strategy for communication, education, knowledge generation (not finished) was prepared although it has not been socialized or consulted with communities and therefore cannot be implemented yet. Two national participation and dialogue platforms (National REDD+ Roundtable and National Environmental Indigenous Commission) and 11 regional dialogue platforms supported, including implementation of the Regional Centers for Environmental Dialogue. Public Policies. The project strengthened MinAmbiente and the Institute of Hydrology, Meteorology and Environmental Studies (IDEAM) teams with 52 consultants who supported the enabling conditions for the implementation of the National REDD+ Strategy. Consultants contributed to the formulation of the National Policy for the Control of Deforestation and Sustainable Forest Management (CONPES 4021 -2020), the National Policy for the National Protected Areas System (CONPES 4050 - 2021), regulations for operation of the national council for deforestation control (<i>Consejo Nacional de Lucha contra la Deforestación- CONALDEF</i>), Decree 690 of 2021 that regulates the sustainable management of wild flora and non-timber forest products, Roadmap and information protocols for MinAmbiente to comply with its commitments under the Sentence of the Court 4360 of 2018 on the protection of the Amazon rainforest, and a law analysis for the regulation of Chapter 4 of Law 170 of 1993, on the “Use of land and protection of natural resources and the environment” by afro-Colombian peoples in the Pacific region.

Component 2: REDD+ Strategy Implementation

Status:	Partially completed
Planned Output:	REDD+ intervention models for deforestation hotspots/agricultural frontier areas.
Actual Output:	Eight intervention models (finished) developed intervention pathways to control deforestation, make sustainable use of forests and provide a livelihood for those communities that live and depend upon forests, aligned with local social, cultural, economic, and environmental conditions. The development of regional intervention models was carried out through technical assistance and analytical studies to promote a forest economy, including sustainable community forest management and commercial forestry. The models were conceived based on the context, needs and problems of each deforestation hotspot and aligned with the strategic lines proposed in the EICDGB. Regional REDD+ Plans were prepared for four <i>Zonas Futuro</i> (<i>Catatumbo, Bajo Cauca, Chiribiquete, and Pacifico Narinense</i>) (finished). <i>Zonas Futuro</i> are territories that were prioritized in the 2016 Havana Peace Agreement for the implementation of interventions and commitments resulted from the peace dialogue process. A standard methodology for the development of the plans was developed and later applied in each selected area. Consultations on the programs and projects



proposed in the Action Plans was carried out with stakeholders at local level. **The Action Plan for deforestation and forest management agreed with indigenous peoples** (not finished) was prepared but not yet agreed between the parties. The expected three regional **Payment for Environmental Services Programs** (not finished) did not yield its intended results, as the only evidence provided by the government are four models of voluntary agreements signed between two regional authorities and one NGO and local communities, for the payment of incentives for restoration of private land, falling short of the government’s own requirements for a PES Program. These agreements do not constitute a PES Program and are not acceptable to the Bank. A mapping of forest conservation and REDD+ initiatives in deforestation hotspots was completed to inform a coordinated strategy to tackle deforestation with support of local governments. Cartography was developed for 13 departments (Cundinamarca, Tolima, Huila, Boyacá, Caldas, Santander, Norte de Santander, Nariño, Antioquia, Cauca, Cesar, Quindío y Risaralda) on deforestation dynamics and land use changes (1:100.000).

Component 3: National Monitoring Systems for Forests and Safeguards

Status: Partially Completed

Planned Output: Community Forest Monitoring System implemented; National Safeguards Information System Operational.

Actual Output: **Community Forest Monitoring System** (finished), strengthened by the development of six pilots (Eastern Andes - Santander and Boyacá; Central Andes - South of Bolivar; Southern Andes - Huila; Amazon piedmont - Caquetá; Amazon - Caquetá; Pacific - Choco) for tailored forest monitoring. **Nine training modules** were designed and implemented within the framework of the "School of Knowledge" of the SMyC of IDEAM, aimed at community organizations, the same responsible of developing the six community forest monitoring pilots, on topics such as: digital processing of images, drivers and agents of forest transformation and deforestation, participatory community monitoring, reference period, stakeholders’ maps, and administrative and management aspects. Knowledge exchange was promoted among local organizations and local and national institutions. **The Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) and Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF)** (finished) documents were updated, and the Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework (IPPF) and Process Framework (PF) were prepared. All received the no objection of the World Bank and will be reference documents for the implementation of the EICDGB. The sixth **National Report of Safeguards Information (RIS)** was prepared for the period October 2020 to September 2021. The RIS is presented voluntarily as part of the commitment to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in its Decision 12/CP.17. For the **Safeguards Information System (SIS)** (not finished), progress was made in the definition of its structure, in the work plan for its construction, in its financing plan for implementation, and in the definition of the terms of reference for the technical team required to finish its design and to operationalize it. However, the SIS still needs to be developed to monitor compliance with safeguards at the different levels of REDD+ implementation.

Component 4: Program Monitoring and Evaluation Framework Status: Finalized

Output: External Audits

Actual Output: There are no pending Audits. The 2019, 2020, 2021 and 2022 audits were conducted with no significant findings.

Comment on planned and actual Output

With two closing date extensions, there was significant progress on all planned outputs. However, some of them were not completed satisfactorily due to the persistent mobility restrictions imposed by COVID-19, to the adverse conditions related to public risk and security in some territories, and in some cases due to inadequate adaptive project planning and delays in decision making at MinAmbiente. These not fully finished outputs are related to (i) the action plan on deforestation and forest management, agreed between MinAmbiente, indigenous organizations, and local communities; (ii) the community strategy for communication, education, and knowledge generation; (iii) the GRM - MAC was designed and improved, but it is not yet accessible; (iv) progress in the construction of the REDD+ SIS, but it isn’t yet operational and/or integrated within the SIAC, and (v) development of three Payment for Environmental Services Programs.



Comment on component implementation progress

Despite the incomplete outputs, there was a significant progress in all the Components, with most of the activities implemented, therefore contributing to strengthen the enabling conditions of Colombia for the implementation of the National REDD+ Strategy. Outputs to highlight include (i) the strengthening of 2 national and 11 regional participation and dialogue platforms; (ii) a capacity building plan; (iii) six public policies that are under implementation; (iv) eight REDD+ intervention models; (v) four REDD+ Regional Strategies; (vi) six forest monitoring pilots designed and under implementation; and (vii) a SESA, ESMF, IPPF and PF.

EXECUTION

Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name: P120899 - Colombia FCPF REDD Readiness
 Project Status: Closed
 Global Focal Area: Climate change
 Product Line: RE - Recipient Executed

Implementing agency and contact details

Agency: Fondo Acción
 Contact: Natalia Arango
 Address: Carrera 7 No 32-33, Piso 27 Bogota, Colombia
 Phone: +57 1 2853862 Email: narango@fondoaccion.org
 Website: www.fondoaccion.org

Agency: Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development
 Contact: Andres Marmolejo
 Address: Calle 37 No 8-40, Bogotá, Colombia
 Phone: (601) 3323400 Email: mmarmolejo@minambiente.gov.co
 Website: www.minambiente.gov.co

PROGRAM

Program Specific Questions

1. Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+ related initiatives, including those funded by delivery partners and other development agencies.

There has been a strong coordination of the FCPF activities since the beginning of the project (2015) with other REDD+ related activities financed through other sources (UN-REDD, FAO, GIZ, USAID).

The interventions of Component 2, which aim at creating the conditions at an institutional, technical, and operative levels to enable the implementation of the REDD+ Strategy to halt deforestation in active deforestation hotspots, are complemented by funding sources that contribute to the implementation of regional activities (BioCF-ISFL (P160680) / GEF 6 Orinoquia Project (P167830), the GEF Heart of the Amazon Project (P144271), and the Amazon Vision program. They also directly contribute to Colombia’s climate mitigation objectives under its Nationally Determined Contribution, which relies to some 75 percent on emission reductions from the agriculture, forests, and land use sector, and whose planning and implementation the World Bank supported through the NDC Deep Dive and follow-on technical assistance. Sub-component 3a, the SMByC, was supported by additional funding from UN-REDD+, funding from the governments of Norway, United Kingdom and Germany under the Joint Declaration of Intent signed with Colombia in 2015 and renewed in 2019, and the GEF Heart of the Amazon Project. Currently



FAO is providing technical assistance to MinAmbiente for the implementation of the community-driven forest monitoring system.

2. Describe any important changes in the technical design or approach related to the Grant activities.

The first restructuring included the revision of the project's results framework. **Original PDO Indicator 1 - REDD+ and regional REDD+ implementation plans have been developed and finalized in consultation various sectors and stakeholders** (End target 1 national and 8 regional), was changed to *REDD+ and regional REDD+ implementation plans have been developed and finalized in consultation with various sectors and stakeholders in four Zonas Futuro (Catatumbo, Bajo Cauca, Chiribiquete, and Pacifico Nariñense)* (End target: 1 national 4 regional), the change was made to align the indicator with the strategy of the national government (2018-2022) for Comprehensive Strategic Interventions in territories of special attention (*Zonas Estratégicas de Intervención Integral*), or Future Zones (*Zonas Futuro*); **Original PDO Indicator 4. An action and financing plan, including a baseline for territorial conflicts, on consolidation of collective land rights is developed** (End target 1) was changed to *an action plan on deforestation and forest management, including a baseline of the territorial, social and environmental conflicts, is agreed between the Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development, indigenous organizations, and local communities* (End Target 1), as original indicator fell within the commitments and responsibilities of the National Land Agency and was outside of the scope of the REDD+ Strategy. For this reason, the activity and the resulting indicator were adjusted to better reflect MinAmbiente's needs and commitments; **Original PDO Indicator 5. Environmental Module for the cadaster developed** (End Target: Yes) was dropped, as that was already being addressed by the National Multipurpose Cadaster Project (P162594).

3. Describe progress in addressing key capacity issues (implementation, technical, financial management, procurement) related to this Grant.

Fondo Acción as the grant's executing agency provided technical, financial management and procurement support to MinAmbiente, conducting processes in a way acceptable to the Bank and its policies. The Bank's Task Team provided constant support to the PIU by holding bi-weekly meetings to address the main bottlenecks affecting implementation and capacity issues. The PIU strengthened its procurement capacity by bringing on board an extra specialist. After both project restructurings, an action plan to speed up implementation was each time agreed among the Bank, the PIU and MinAmbiente. Interagency bottlenecks with respect to the preparation and approval of terms of reference persisted, delaying procurement processes and ultimately, project implementation

4. Describe progress in addressing social and environmental issues (including safeguards) related to the Grant. Is the SESA conducted in accordance with the Common Approach?

The National SESA that included the Pacific, Andes, Caribbean, Amazon and Orinoquia regions was finalized with the second grant and was conducted in accordance with the Common Approach (applicable to FCPF). The document was updated under the third grant in 2022 to revise the risks and mitigation measures established in 2018. This process took place through a participatory process in which indigenous peoples, afro-Colombian communities and rural producers generated new information that informed a new analysis of risks and new mitigation measures for the proposed programs, actions and measures established in the EICDGB for the Pacific, Andes, Caribbean, and Amazon regions. The Orinoquia region update has been covered under the Biocarbon Project financed by the Initiative for Sustainable Forest Landscapes (ISFL) (P160680). The grant made progress in the construction of the REDD+ Safeguards Information System, but this isn't operational yet or integrated into the National Environmental Information System (SIAC).

5. Is the ESMF prepared in accordance with the Common Approach?

The ESMF was finalized and in accordance with the Common Approach. The formulation of the Process Framework and the Indigenous Peoples Framework in line with the Bank's safeguards' policies. However, the ESMF has yet to be put into operation.

6. Describe progress in stakeholder consultation, participation, disclosure of information, and the FGRM related to this Grant.

Building on a strong trajectory of multi-stakeholder consultations on REDD+ since initiating the national REDD+ process in 2008. With this grant, Colombia held at least 39 spaces for stakeholder consultation, participation, disclosure of information, GRM and R-Package. In these spaces participated representatives from the public and private sector, indigenous and afro-descendent communities, smallholder farmers, NGOs, academia, and international cooperation agencies, with a total of 1782 people (46% women). This spaces included national level encounters National REDD+ Forums and National Environmental Indigenous Commission, and regional level encounters of the Afro-Colombian roundtable, the Regional Amazon Indigenous roundtable, the Regional Andean-Amazon roundtable, the women's roundtable; additional sessions for the dialogue platform of the Atrato River, and dialogue spaces for the consolidation of four Regional Centers of Environmental Dialogue for the Amazon, Pacific, Caribbean and Andes regions. Encounters to develop the CONPES 4050 National Policy for the National Protected Areas System; to establish the guidelines for a community monitoring system; workshops with a gender approach for sustainable forest management; cero deforestation agreements; women reunions for knowledge sharing on traditional practices on natural resources use; and many more across the regions. In addition, spaces included the Amazon Regional Board for dialogue between the indigenous peoples of the Amazon and the national government for the construction of the Intergenerational Pact for the life of the Colombian



Amazon (PIVAC). This Pact was ordered by supreme court sentence STC 4360/2018 that declared the Colombian Amazon as a subject of rights. Finally, three regional and 1 national workshop were held for the R-Package preparation, with the participation of 99 people.

Finally, the government's GRM was supported with technical assistance for the prioritization and provision of REDD+ information in native languages, improvement of the clarity of the language used to provide REDD+ information, characterization of REDD+ users to improve channels of communications and strengthening considerations for people with disabilities. The REDD+ GRM is not yet operational.

COMPLETION

Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

Main lessons learned:

- Dialogue and consultation platforms constitute the most effective way to engage local communities but require continuous support to operate.
- The design of intervention models, monitoring pilots and financial mechanisms needs to be done in close cooperation with local communities.
- The National Forest and Carbon Monitoring System needs to include community-driven monitoring processes to close local-regional-national gaps.
- Changes in administration will always cause delays as leadership and approaches change. Clear roadmaps are necessary.
- Support for strengthened enabling conditions needs to be accompanied by a clear pathway for implementation, including necessary funding, to achieve impact and manage external expectations.

Overall outcome (and its Sustainability):

Comment:

Colombia has been engaged in REDD+ readiness for fourteen years and is eager to move towards implementation. The REDD+ Strategy Options are well-aligned with the main direct and indirect drivers of deforestation, but several areas still need strengthening to ensure current and future REDD+ programs and projects can be implemented at scale.

The REDD+ Readiness support significantly improved the enabling conditions for the implementation of the National REDD+ Strategy, the strengthening of MinAmbiente and its directorates (Biodiversity and Forest; Climate Change; and Education Directorates) as the main REDD+ institution, as well as tools and policies needed to move to the next phases, including the operation of 2 national and 9 regional dialogue platforms; and the development of 4 regional REDD+ Strategies, 8 intervention models for deforestation hotspots, and safeguard instruments (SESA, ESMF, IPPF and PF). The Feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanism and the National Safeguards Information System are still under development. Both are vital for a fair and transparent implementation of REDD+. Colombia has for the moment no plan to develop benefit sharing legislation but recognizes the need for generating specific regulations to assure that the communities that carry out activities for conservation, restoration, and sustainable forest ecosystem management in the framework of REDD+ get a fair and equitable distribution of the resources and benefits generated. A benefit sharing plan (BSP) is currently under development for the ISFL-Biocarbon Fund Emission Reductions Program for the Orinoquia region. Other regions of Colombia could take advantage of reviewing this regional plan.

The dialogue platforms established with the support of the FCPF project constitute spaces of interaction and decision making for local communities and other stakeholders and their maintenance is part of long-time commitments acquired between the GoC and the communities. Their sustainability is vital to address conflicts that are affecting local communities and their forests. The grant financed the development of national policies of high impact on deforestation control issues. The implementation of the REDD+ Strategy constitutes a priority for the new government and the new administration is interested in implementing and use the grant's outputs and results. The REDD+ dialogue enhanced attention to the local communities that live and depend on forests across Colombia, as well as to the need of diverse and differentiated interventions needed to address deforestation and forest degradation.

Bank Performance:

Comment:

The overall Bank Performance is Satisfactory, based on quality at entry, project supervision and in-time restructurings. Biweekly meetings took place between the TT, Fondo Acción and MinAmbiente since mid-2020 until the closing date as well as regular supervision missions were organized and documented (Aide-Memoire), Non-Objections were provided to the client under reasonable timeframes, and regular and timely reporting was done to Bank management and FCPF donors. The Bank team provided close support and technical advice throughout implementation of the grant financed activities.

Additional Assessment



Development / strengthening of institutions:

Comment:

The capacity of MinAmbiente as REDD focal point and IDEAM as the one responsible for the National Forest and Carbon Monitoring System has increased thanks to the grant support. Colombia has strengthened its institutional capacity and is in an improved position to implement results-based REDD+ payments.

Mobilization of other resources:

Comment:

MinAmbiente has carried out a proactive management of international funds, and only international funds have been used for the REDD+ readiness process. Resources were obtained from the FCPF Readiness Fund, UN-REDD, GIZ REDD+ Program, and joint cooperation resources from the governments of Norway, Germany and the United Kingdom, as well as funding from the German government BMU-IKI program (Investment in climate protection (REDD+) and peacebuilding in Colombia).

Knowledge exchange:

Comment:

During the time of implementation of the third grant, Colombia REDD+ team participated in a virtual training on community-based forestry called '*Métodos y Herramientas para el Manejo Forestal Comunitario y la Restauración de Paisajes Forestales*' with the Costa Rican Tropical Centre for Agronomical Research and Learning (CATIE - Centro Agronómico Tropical de Investigación y Enseñanza). Where 178 people participated (45% women).

Client's policy / program implementation:

Comment:

Policies, actions, and measures for REDD+ implementation have been built throughout the REDD+ preparation process. The lines of action were generated in a consolidated and detailed way, considering the needs and potentials of the national territory. It is however considered necessary to improve the continuity and presence of key actors at the regional and local levels, and to make significant efforts to decentralize the implementation of the Strategy, while expanding its benefits. One additional aspect to improve is to ensure inter-sectoral activities at the regional and local levels, and to deliver results at scale.

The review of the national political and legal framework is complete and shows that Colombia has advanced in this area and is better prepared to take the next step into results-based payment.

Efficiency:

Comment:

Efficiency is rated as Modest based on some shortcomings that adversely influenced project implementation. Some coordination shortcomings that included at least 3 different Project coordinators from 2019 to 2022 and turnover in the administration affected timely decision making and caused implementation delays. The COVID 19 pandemic affected project efficiency due to related mobility restrictions. Despite timely restructurings, not all the activities for the three main components were completed as not all PDO indicators were achieved.

Replicability:

Comment:

The inter-institutional coordination on national and regional level is positive but should be developed further and integrate all the most relevant NGOs/CSOs, academia and the interested private sector parties, including the forestry and agricultural sector. The National REDD+ strategy has incorporated elements of the three Rio Conventions (UNFCCC, UNCBD, UNCCD), and reporting on the progress of REDD+ in Colombia could therefore be incorporated into the national reporting to the conventions. Although the process could be strengthened with public and private sector co-financing.

Main recommendations to stakeholders:

Colombia has made significant progress in REDD+ Readiness since the mid-term review in 2017, but much should still be done.

Based on the achievements and lessons learned from implementation of this project, the following is recommended:

1. Colombia should advance rapidly to strengthen the current weaknesses in guidelines for implementation; benefit-sharing; and a national REDD+ registry.
2. Colombia should continue developing and strengthening its multi-purpose information systems, to improve



governance, safeguards, and monitoring, reporting and information sharing, as well as institutional arrangements and capacities.

- 3. Colombia should clarify aspects of Article 6 and carbon title transfer and regulate the voluntary carbon market to mitigate risks for the carbon market as a whole.

Main recommendations to Bank Management:

Colombia is ready to implement its REDD+ Strategy and associated policies, with strengthened policies, institutions and conditions, and strong political will and leadership. To achieve transformational results on deforestation control it needs to develop a comprehensive program focused on:

- creating sustainable and inclusive productive alternatives that are connected to markets, within a framework of comprehensive strengthened government service provision and strengthened land rights and administration in deforestation hotspots
- aligning and implementing policies between the central, departmental, and municipal levels of government to improve the effectiveness of government interventions
- strengthening the National Environmental System and harmonizing procedures across sectors to improve institutional governance and regulation of sectors that drive deforestation
- improving the efficiency of expenditures and adopting a more coordinated approach to investment in deforestation control

DISBURSEMENTS

Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
01/01/2018	06/30/2018	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2018	12/31/2018	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2019	06/30/2019	0.00	0.00	100,000.00	100,000.00
07/01/2019	12/31/2019	0.00	0.00	561,937.00	461,937.00
01/01/2020	06/30/2020	0.00	0.00	933,689.87	371,752.87
07/01/2020	12/31/2020	0.00	0.00	1,282,572.74	348,882.87
01/01/2021	06/30/2021	0.00	0.00	1,561,574.15	279,001.41
07/01/2021	12/31/2021	0.00	0.00	3,175,488.78	1,613,914.63
01/01/2022	06/30/2022	0.00	0.00	4,166,938.32	991,449.54
01/07/2022	12/31/2022	0.00	0.00	3,913,396.05	-253,542.27