

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA1223  
Printed On: 03/26/2020

Reporting Period: 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TFOA1223

## Congo Forest Carbon Partnership Facility - Additional Financing FCPFR - Forest Carbon Partnership Facility

Task Team Leader: 00000411336 - Pierre Guigon  
Approving Manager: 00000251917 - Africa Eshogba Olojoba

Summary Information	
TF Status	ACTV
Recipient Country	Congo
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	9835 - SAFE3
Grant Start Date / End Date	12/08/2015 to 08/31/2019
Original Grant Amount	5,200,000.00
Grant Amount	5,200,000.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	5,198,431.73 as of 06/30/2019
Disbursed 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019	5,198,431.73
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

*This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Components, Outcome, Execution, Program(FCPFR), Completion, Disbursements, Procurement Plan, Procurement Actuals.*

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

## Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA1223  
Printed On: 03/26/2020

Reporting Period: 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Approved

## OVERVIEW

### Overall Assessments

#### Grant Objectives:

To reinforce the Republic of Congo's capacities to design a socially and environmentally sound national strategy to reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation (REDD+) and to inform the development of a national reference emissions level for REDD+.

#### Overall progress from 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

##### Comment:

Overall progress towards the grant objective was moderately satisfactory. The Republic of the Congo presented its Readiness Package at the 22nd meeting of the Committee of Participants of the FCPF (PC22), held from 26 to 28 September 2016 in Accra, Ghana. The FCPF Committee approved it by resolution No. PC/22/2016/3 and stressed the importance of the work program in completing the Readiness work. The results of the participatory readiness self-assessment process carried out on REDD + preparation between May and July 2016 are the following. Based on the 34 criteria of the framework for the evaluation of the Readiness Package, the national interlocutors evaluated 12 criteria as having significantly increased (green), 16 having progressed satisfactorily (yellow) and 6 having progressed in a way Limited for which additional efforts are needed (orange). As a result of this evaluation, the country prepared a work program to continue the preparation activities and operationalize the main tools of REDD +. These activities were fully implemented until December 2018 which was the closing date of the REDD + readiness project. On this basis, the national interlocutors reviewed the results of the 2016 self-assessment and estimated that by the end of the REDD + readiness project in December 2018 most of the criteria had significantly increased (31 out of 34) or progressed satisfactorily (3 out of 34). One key achievement was the finalization of the Program Document for Sangha-Likouala Emissions Reductions Program and approval by the FCPF Carbon Fund Participants in March 2019, allowing ROC into the portfolio of both Tranche A and Tranche B of the Carbon Fund. It should also be noted that all safeguards instruments developed for ER program were approved by the World Bank and published.

#### Overall progress from 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

##### Comment:

As explained above activities planned in the Readiness Package were implemented. Over the course of project implementation deficient prioritization of key activities and procurement were the main bottlenecks delaying implementation and reducing effectiveness. A change of staff at the project's fiduciary agency in FY17 negatively impacted the effectiveness of support from the procurement and financial management specialists in FY17. The extension to December 31, 2018 proved useful in allowing CN-REDD to complete key activities. Significant issues arose post-closing in 2019 regarding financial management. Delays in payment affected several contractors. The Bank closely monitored the situation so that most delayed payments are settled using remaining funds (grace period was extended by two month), and then facilitated last remaining payments on government's own budget. Such issue also concerned the auditing firm which had not been paid for both the 2017 and 2018 financial audits. Government paid the auditor in December 2019. The audit reports point at potential ineligible and missing jurisdictions and reports that the Bank is currently following with government on. The Bank will seek reimbursement for confirmed ineligible.

### Grant follow-up and structure

#### Description and context of Grant:

Not applicable.

**Expected follow up (if any):** Follow up Bank project/loan/credit/grant

#### Comment on follow up:

One key follow-up activity is the Sangha-Likouala Emissions Reductions Program (P163361) which is a 55 million USD result-based program supported by the FCPF Carbon (ERPA). Funding from the German single donor trust fund (ACCEL REDD) was secured in 2019 to support ROC with the technical work towards ERPA negotiations. In addition, the Forest Investment Program, the Dedicated Grant Mechanism for Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities, and the Central African Forest Initiative are being prepared, through facing delay, to provide REDD+ investments that should operationalize the REDD+ instruments and frameworks developed under this grant.

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA1223  
Printed On: 03/26/2020

Reporting Period: 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Approved

End Date of Last Site Visit:

Restructuring of Grant:  
Not applicable.

## OUTCOME

### Comments on outcome achieved from 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019

### Grant Outcome Indicators

No Outcome indicators are defined or used for this grant.

## COMPONENTS

### Output and Implementation by Component

#### Support to the coordination of the REDD+ Readiness Process and Multi-stakeholder Consultations

Status: Completed  
Planned Output: CN-REDD is functional and equipped.  
Actual Output: CN-REDD is fully staffed, REDD+ workshops and stakeholder engagement process continue to support final activities

#### Contribution to the design of a national REDD+ strategy

Status: Completed  
Planned Output: National REDD+ infrastructure: Strategy, SESA, ESMF  
Actual Output: National REDD+ Strategy approved by CONA-REDD (Oct. 2017) and Council of Ministers (April 2018); SESA and ESMF approved by the WB in December 2018

#### Informing the national reference scenario for REDD+

Status: Completed  
Planned Output: None planned  
Actual Output: Reference scenario validated by UNFCCC in July 2017

### Comment on planned and actual Output

### Comment on component implementation progress

None

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TF0A1223  
Printed On: 03/26/2020

Reporting Period: 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Approved

## EXECUTION

### Bank project related to the grant

Project ID / Name: P124292 - CG - FCPF REDD READINESS  
Project Status: Lending  
Global Focal Area: Climate change  
Product Line: CN - Carbon Offset

### Implementing agency and contact details

Agency: Ministry of Forest Economy - CN-REDD  
Contact: Georges Bounzdanga  
Address: CN-REDD, Quartier OCH, pres de l'Hotel Florida  
Phone: +242 06 66 67 321 Email: bouzgege@yahoo.fr  
Website:

## PROGRAM

### Program Specific Questions

**1. Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+-related initiatives, including those funded by Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+-related initiatives, including those f**

UN-REDD ended its activities in 2016. Then FCPF has supported the REDD+ readiness from 2013 and 2018. For the investment phase, financing from FIP, DGM, CAFI and GEF are being coordinated to maximize success of the FCPF Carbon Fund-led Emissions Reductions Program and the wider REDD+ agenda. However, there has been a time and finance gap between the end of this grant (December 2018) and the start of the other projects (only GEF project is on-going). This puts at risk of sustainability of the project's output, that is the REDD+ infrastructure and tools.

**2. Describe any important changes in the technical design or approach related to the Grant activities.**  
Not applicable.

**3. Describe progress in addressing key capacity issues (implementation, technical, financial management, procurement) related to this Grant.**

As indicated earlier there was little progress made on financial management and procurement over the course of the grant. In regards to implementation, most components of REDD+ readiness were established but sustainability will be an issue given the lack of financing post grant closing.

**4. Describe progress in addressing social and environmental issues (including safeguards) related to the Grant. Is the SESA conducted in accordance with the Common Approach?**

The Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) was approved by the World Bank along with the Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF) and of its several safeguards instruments including the Resettlement Policy Framework (RPF), Process Framework (PF), Physical Cultural Resources Management Plan (PCRMP), Indigenous Peoples Planning Framework (IPPF) and Pest and Pesticide Management Plan (PPMP). Consultation missions and validation workshops of the Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) were organized at national and sub-national levels (Sangha Likouala). All these documents have been disclosed on the Ministry of Forest Economy and the World Bank website.

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

## Report to Donor

Ref.	TF0A1223	Reporting Period:	12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	03/26/2020	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

## 5. Is the ESMF prepared in accordance with the Common Approach?

Yes

## 6. Describe progress in stakeholder consultation, participation, disclosure of information, and the FGRM related to this Grant.

CN-REDD relied a lot on the national CSO and indigenous peoples platform (CACO-REDD) for regular consultations and to share information with the civil society. In addition, special emphasis was placed on field consultations in the northern regions, including during preparation of the SESA and safeguards instruments, FGRM, benefit sharing plan etc. Examples of activities which took place in FY18 include: 1/ Stakeholder consultations on the national GRM in the departments of Cuvette, Cuvette-Ouest, Plateaux, Niari, Lekoumou, Bouenza in October and November 2017; 2/ The organization of the national validation workshop of the GRM for the Sangha-Likouala Emissions Reduction Program which took place in Brazzaville in December 2017 and brought together 35 participants, including 23 government delegates, 4 indigenous people and 8 civil society people. In FY19 a lot of workshops and capacity building activities were organized for national stakeholders to gain better understanding and ownership of the strategic and technical tools of REDD+. Main consultations were organized through the different platforms (Public sector platform, including REDD+ Focal Points of Ministries, Private sector platform for REDD+, and Civil society and indigenous peoples' platform for REDD+ - CACO-REDD) were covering the following:

- Validation workshop of the GRM at national and sub national level (Sangha Likouala);
- Consolidation and validation workshops of the Safeguard Information System (SIS) at the national and sub-national levels (ER-P Sangha Likouala);
- Organization of consultation missions and workshops to consolidate and validate the guide and grid on reduced impact logging standards (EFIR).
- Organization of consultation missions and workshops for consolidation and validation of the National REDD+ Investment Plan established for the 2018-2025 period;

In addition, different training were carried out, including on: (i) modalities for calculating carbon, emission reductions, carbon credits, etc., (ii) design of REDD+ projects, (iii) appropriation of technical and strategic tools of Phase 1 of the REDD+ process (safeguards, NERF, MRV, etc.). It is particularly about: (i) agents of the CNIAF, (ii) members of the Pan-African Forum of Climate Ambassadors or FPAC, (iii) members of the NGO Eveil d'Afrique and many young people sponsored by third parties;

Finally, regarding disclosure, the different REDD+ platforms (public sector platform, public sector platform and civil society and indigenous people's platform) have been informed about the national REDD+ strategy. Then the safeguards instruments have been disclosed on the WB and Government websites.

## COMPLETION

### Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

#### Main lessons learned:

Since 2008, the country has been committed to the Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD+) process. However, key lessons learned of interest at completion concern sustainability of outcome:

#

-The level of organization of the MEF and the administration in general is extremely low, which poses enormous challenges for the implementation of a program as complex as the ERP. Similarly, the lack of transparency and weak governance in all sectors of the administration jeopardize the smooth running of performance-based payments. The few local mechanisms for financial support (such as Local Development Funds) or community organization (such as Community Management and Development Committees) have extremely limited impacts and are not sustainable.

-The economic crisis of 2014 has had a significant impact on forestry companies who are currently struggling to make a profit from their economic activities, are unable to invest and are afraid to embark on new activities such as carbon payments.

#### Overall outcome (and its Sustainability):

##### Comment:

The PREDD allowed for the establishment of the main REDD+ institutions and tools needed to move to the next phases including investment and the implementation of the ERP for result based payment: safeguard instruments, benefit-sharing mechanism,

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

## Report to Donor

Ref.	TF0A1223	Reporting Period:	12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	03/26/2020	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

Grievance Redress Mechanism, Measurement, Reporting and Verification System, Information Registry, Transactional Registry. However, 2 major tools could not be finalized under the project's timeframe : the Benefit Sharing Plan (BSP) of the ERP and its Reference Emission Level (REL). These will be supported through AccelREDD. Overall, the REDD+ tools and framework but also the capacity developed throughout grant implementation are at risk if the funding gap is sustained for too long in the absence of substantial REDD+ investment and result based payments.

### Bank Performance:

#### Comment:

The overall Bank Performance is moderately satisfactory, based on quality at entry, project supervision and additional resource mobilization. Regular supervision missions were organized and documented (Aide-Memoire), Non-Objections were provided to the client under reasonable timeframes, and regular reporting was done to the Bank and donors. Funds were mobilized timely and under an extensive timeframe including post-closing with AccelREDD in order to address the funding gap in the interim before the investment and result based payment phases. There were 6 Task Team Leaders in total which indicates a high turnover especially considering the low capacity and fiduciary risks in the country.

## Additional Assessment

### Development / strengthening of institutions:

#### Comment:

Decree n° 260-2015 of February 27, 2015 on the creation, attributions, organization and functioning of the management bodies for the implementation of the REDD+ process provides a framework for the REDD+ process in the Republic of Congo. The national institutional architecture relating to the implementation of the REDD+ process is structured around an institutional axis involving including the National REDD Committee (CONA-REDD), the National REDD Coordination (CN-REDD), the 12 REDD+ Departmental Committees (CODEPA-REDD), the platform of Civil Society Organizations and Indigenous Peoples (CACO-REDD), the private sector platform on REDD+. All these bodies and institutions were fully operational until December 2018 but reduced activity significantly after closing. For example, CN-REDD now only counts 3 part time staff (the Coordinator, the Lawyer and a Secretary). The private platform (with mainly mining industries and forest companies) remains largely inactive.

### Mobilization of other resources:

#### Comment:

The amount of all funding received in support of the development and delivery of your national REDD+ readiness process since the date your R-PP was signed (in 2010) is \$ 13.5 million.

\$ 3.400.000 Readiness FCPF grant January 2011  
\$ 4.000.000 UN-REDD grant January 2013  
\$ 5.200.000 Readiness FCPF grant (2) November 2015  
\$ 250.000 FIP grant October 2016  
\$ 650.000 CAFI grant July 2017

Regarding the REDD+ investment phase, total mobilization includes:

\$ 5.800.000 AFD/CACAO  
\$ 5.000.000 APV-FLEGT/UE  
\$ 6.200.000 OI-FLEGT/DFID  
\$ 100.000.000 PDAC/BM  
\$ 3.200.000 FEM/PNUD  
\$ 8.000.000 AFD/PPFNC  
\$ 15.000.000 PFDE1/IDA & Congo  
\$ 6.500.000 PFDE2/GEF6  
\$ 1.500.000 PRISP/BM  
\$ 5.000.000 EU/FFEM

### Knowledge exchange:

#### Comment:

Knowledge exchange benefitted to all stakeholders across REDD+ institutions, civil society and local communities including

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

---

## Report to Donor

Ref.	TF0A1223	Reporting Period:	12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019
Printed On:	03/26/2020	Report Type:	Completion
		Report Status:	Approved

---

CACO-REDD+ (Cadre de Concertation des Organisations de la Société Civile et des Populations Autochtones sur la REDD+) and RENAPAC (Reseau National des Populations Autochtones) which represents officially Indigenous Peoples. Overall key Ministries were involved the REDD+ process through focal points (Agriculture, Mining, Planning, Finance, Major Works, Land, Environment) including with high-level policy dialogues, and for the endorsement of main output. International workshops and other meetings set up by donors (FCPF, CAFI, FIP) were mostly attended by the Government representatives (CN-REDD and the Ministry of Forest Economy).

### Client's policy / program implementation:

#### Comment:

The funds mobilized within the framework of the REDD+ process enabled the Republic of Congo to consolidate and validate the main strategic and technical tools of phase 1 (REDD+ readiness phase) as programmed in its RPP as planned under the PREDD. The Investment Plan of the national REDD+ strategy, established for the period 2018-2025 is supported by 6 geographically integrated sectoral programs:

- the Emission Reduction Program (ER-P) in Sangha and Likouala;
- the Community Agroforestry and Wood Energy Program in the Pool and Plateaux departments;
- the Program for the Sustainable Management of Mayombe Forest Ecosystems and Coastal Ecosystems;
- the Program for Forest Plantations, Agroforestry and Sustainable Forest Management in the Niari Valley;
- the Program for the Sustainable Management of the Chaillu Massif;
- the Community Agroforestry Program in the Congolese Cuvette.

### Efficiency:

#### Comment:

The project achieved its objectives in a timely manner with one key result being the endorsement of Congo's Readiness Package at the 22nd meeting of the Committee of Participants of the FCPF (PC22) in September 2016. Challenges and uncertainty still remain, however, over a successful transition to the next phase of REDD+ in particular result-based payments. Challenges facing the project during implementation include:

- Institutional: the CN-REDD and other REDD+ established bodies were left unfunded after the end of the project, spurring uncertainty over the future of this institution and hence the sustainability of REDD+ implementation in ROC.
- Operational: delay and uncertainty on the implementation of the FIP financed project in Northern Congo did not allow to road test REDD+ tools and institutions in the context of REDD+ investments.

### Replicability:

#### Comment:

REDD+ is generally considered to be implemented in three phases: I. Readiness; II. Investments; and III. Results-based payments. The phases are not purely sequential but can instead overlap to a significant extent based on national circumstances. In phases I and II, the national REDD+ strategy is being developed and implemented through the facilitation and improvement of enabling conditions (legal framework, capacity building, governance structures and monitoring and verifications systems) and early investments in results-based demonstration activities. Phase III provides payments for verified emission reductions, achieved among other things through activities in the second phase. Despite the funding and timing gap between phase I and phases II et III, ROC should progressively move on to the next phases of REDD+ especially considering recent developments and donors' commitments. In April 2019, the CAFI Board formalized in a decision its willingness to launch a policy dialogue and start the negotiations on a Letter of Intent with the Republic of Congo, with consideration of a minimum amount of US\$ 45 million through the CAFI Trust Fund, and an additional minimum amount of US\$ 20 million in new and aligned bilateral funding. In the Republic of Congo, the Prime Minister led the negotiations of the Letter of Intent and established an inter-ministerial working group under his office to pilot the implementation of the National Investment Framework. On 3 September 2019, the Letter of Intent was signed in Paris between Presidents Macron (France) and Sassou Nguesso (Republic of Congo). In 2019 also started AFD's project on Support the revival of the agricultural sector focused on the cocoa industry as part of the ER-Program in Sangha and Likouala and, around Brazzaville, the development of market gardening. These investments will participate to generation of emissions reductions ER-Program in Sangha and Likouala which could be valued through the pursued ERPA (phase III).

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TF0A1223  
Printed On: 03/26/2020

Reporting Period: 12/08/2015 to 06/30/2019  
Report Type: Completion  
Report Status: Approved

## Main recommendations to stakeholders:

Many lessons regarding stakeholder engagement include:

- The experience of the travelling forum theatre, an innovation highly appreciated by stakeholders, is now a tool for raising awareness and communicating the REDD+ process in the Republic of Congo;
- The publication of REDD+ documents in national languages (Lingala and Kituba);
- The training of REDD+ communicators in all social categories of the country and communication in local languages;
- The experience of sessions known as "REDD+ University" for all social categories of the country on key REDD+ themes;
- The firm commitment of the Government and other stakeholders (civil society, LCIP, private sector, academia, etc.) to the REDD+ process;
- The interest of stakeholders to participate in the process of formulation and consolidation of technical components such as: the reference emission level (REL) and the Measurement, Reporting and Verification or Measurement, Reporting and Verification (MRV) system;
- The commitment of national stakeholders to take ownership of the modelling processes for forest carbon, emissions, carbon credits and others.
- Establishment of numerous REDD expert panels on major political, scientific and technical issues (NERF expert panel, MRV expert panel, REDD+ register expert panel, REDD+ project development expert panel, etc.).

## Main recommendations to Bank Management:

Phase 3 on result based payment (ERPA) is a highly technical and sensitive process which would require more time and funding on the country side during REDD+ preparation (or more efficient use of available time and funding) and also strong support to the World Bank's teams given the time involved and need for specific skill sets.

## DISBURSEMENTS

### Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
07/01/2015	12/31/2015	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
01/01/2016	06/30/2016	0.00	0.00	1,286,721.97	1,286,721.97
07/01/2016	12/31/2016	0.00	0.00	2,001,803.15	715,081.18
01/01/2017	06/30/2017	0.00	0.00	3,171,668.88	1,169,865.73
07/01/2017	12/31/2017	0.00	0.00	4,732,510.86	1,560,841.98
01/01/2018	06/30/2018	0.00	0.00	5,137,754.00	405,243.14
07/01/2018	12/31/2018	0.00	0.00	5,137,754.00	0.00
01/01/2019	06/30/2019	0.00	0.00	5,198,431.73	60,677.73
07/01/2019	12/31/2019	0.00	0.00	5,199,985.38	1,553.65

## PROCUREMENT PLAN

None

## PROCUREMENT ACTUAL

None