Responses to PC and TAP Review Comments on Belize's RPP

Component	PC CO-Chairs Recommendations	Response	Location in RPP
General	Provide additional information on the early dialogue with stakeholders, including Indigenous communities and organizations, in the preparation of the R-PP.	Several documents were presented to the FMT on April 16th, including the Belize RPP Early Dialogue Report, the RPP Stakeholders list, the REDD+ RPP Consultation Methodology, the IPs Consultation Final Report and the REDD+ RPP Social Consultation Stakeholder Analysis and Preliminary Social Assessment. Also included were several annexes related to the various early dialogue workshops that were held. The Consultation Protocol with Indigenous Peoples was also presented to the FMT on 9th June, 2014. Text was also changes in C1b from "Consultation" to "Early Dialogue"	Supplementary, supporting documents
General	Include in the Consultation and Participation Plan issues that have been identified in the early dialogue with stakeholders, including issues related to Indigenous Peoples' land tenure and rights, recognizing that the Government of Belize noted it will respect the decisions of the courts currently reviewing cases related to Indigenous Peoples' land tenure and rights.	The Annexes related to Early Dialogue include the issues of interest to the stakeholders (Table 7, Appendix D). C1b also identifies land tenure as a critical issue for stakeholders	Table 2, page 25
General	Review the budget to ensure all REDD+ consultation processes are adequately financed, and consider assigning resources to strengthen stakeholders' national representation and capacity to participate in consultations.	Budget 1a, "Engagement of Key Stakeholders" includes USD 55K for workshops, capacity building and institutional strengthening for Private Sector, Civil Society and IPs. USD 135K has been assigned to the Consultation Process in C1c. Budget 2a also proposes a budget of USD 135K towards "Supporting dialogue on governance of forests with TAA, NAVCO, DAVCO"	Pg 20, 36, 54,91
General	Provide for the implementation, as part of the SESA, of special studies on gender issues and land tenure patterns, and for the identification and evaluation of legal and policy measures related to Indigenous Peoples' land tenure and rights.	Component 1b considers specific gender studies and plan to enhance women's participation on forest management. C2c includes an assessment of carbon rights which would be associated with specific land tenure, including traditional customary land rights.	Pg 29, Table 14 page 82,

Component	TAP Recommendations	Response	Location in RPP
C1a. Largely Met	Describe in a narrative way the functions, hierarchy and relations of the NCCC with other institutions	Further clarifications were made as to the composition and responsibilities of the BNCCC and the role of the Office of the Prime Minister and REDD+ lead Ministry namely, the Ministry of Forests, Fisheries and Sustainable Development (MFSSD). It was also clarified that the Minister of MFSSD will be the person responsible for reporting and liaising directly with Cabinet on the functions of the BNCCC. Clarifications were also made to the structure and relationship of the BNCCC with relevant government ministries and agencies. Members of the BNCCC are essentially drawn from relevant Ministry and public sector agencies. These have a direct role in the BNCCC as well as will participate in more specific technical areas on the various subcommittees established or to be established under the BNCCC. The BNCCC is a high level committee and Ministries are represented directly by the Chief Executive Officers including the Office of the Prime Minister so that decisions can be carried as efficiently as possible.	Pgs 8-12
	Consider the inclusion in the NCCC of representatives of all Indigenous Peoples of the country	This has been considered. The proposal is to firstly support indigenous groups and organization to establish a process to identify a representative of indigenous peoples to sit as a member of the BNCCC. Secondly, in order to accommodate the additional IP member, the BNCCC membership will have to be expanded. Since Cabinet is the body responsible for establishing the BNCCC and defining its membership, the addition to the BNCCC will need Cabinet approval before being finalized. In the meantime, indigenous peoples, mainly the Mayas of Toledo who have an outstanding land rights claim will be part of the Readiness Activities Steering Committee. The role of the Readiness Activities Steering Committee (RASC) has also been expanded to include the responsibility for establishing a Feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanism (FGRM) Panel at the level of the RASC. Process to establishing the FGRM Panel has been included.	Paragraph 1 pg. 9

C1b. Met	The TAP review recommended in November 2013 that early dialogue and consultation should include all aspects related to land tenure and IP. This issue was considered in the present version of the R-PP. Likewise as recommended previously, minutes of meetings are now included in the document.		
C1c. Largely Met	Include among the elements to be discussed: IP land tenure, and other rights and key issues for a REDD+ process, in addition to the budget needed to complete this.	This has been incorporated. IP land tenure and other rights and related issues are incorporated at various points of the REDD+ readiness process including consultation, planning and designing, implementation and monitoring. The REDD+ process of consultation is expected to assist in maintaining and even intensifying dialogue with indigenous peoples not only over sustainable land use and forest management but also in considering the issues related to land tenure and other relevant rights. To contribute to this process, during the REDD+ consultation, an Indigenous Peoples REDD+ Roundtable (IPRR) is proposed. The Roundtable is essentially a forum for discussion of issues specific to IPs. To ensure that there is a direct relationship with the implementation of readiness activities and the IP Roundtable, members of the Readiness Activities Steering Committee and the REDD+ Coordination Unit will be a part of the Roundtable.

What is laid out in the document will be followed sequentially where the consultation plan will initially be designed with its objectives clarified, and selecting the most appropriate methodologies. This will then be followed by implementation, and will ensure that there is a feedback system to inform the management and oversight of the readiness activities. Key aspects such as the inclusion of indigenous peoples and a feedback and grievance redressal mechanism are integral to the process. | C. and E. table 3 pg 32, 2nd paragraph, page 33, Budget 1c pg. 36 |
| C2a. Met | Although this section is very well presented, some description of the heterogeneity of forest ecosystems in Belize would be welcomed. Drivers may be different and/or present a different | Land use and land cover table and maps have been included | Pgs 37-39 |

	intensity in each forest type. This is important for the strategy options designed to diminish deforestation rates. For example in the savannas, fire might be an historical practice used by Indigenous Peoples, and a rigid control of this process may lead to biomass accumulation (combustible material), resulting in more intense wild fires, which are very difficult to control.		
C2b. Met	The document could improve its quality by including the heterogeneity of the different forest ecosystems at Belize, and the need to design different strategy options for each of them (as pointed in section 2a).	One of the threats to some specific forest ecosystems is Wildfire. The RPP now includes the implementation of the Wildland Fire Strategy to the tune of USD 750,000 over the project period. Improved land use planning through the implementation of the NLUP should also support the reduction of threats to different forest types. The Protected Areas system is already functional in its protection of the different forest ecosystems. A strategy proposed is to expand the permanent sample plot network into forest types that are not currently represented by the existing PSPs.	Pg 65-67, Table 10, pg 69
	Also, more details on how the government is planning to improve law enforcement and resource planning related to aspects such as illegal logging and uncontrolled land clearing and conversion should be included.	Enforcement of the forest legislation is being supported by the GEF Key Biodiversity areas Project, through the establishment of a Monitoring and Compliance Unit with the Forest Department. The KBA project is also supporting the revision of the Forests Act and supporting legislation. Likewise, the entire discussion on forest governance through the REDD+ process will consider a more important role for local governments in enforcement. Agricultural development can be sustainable. The RPP provides support for improving collaboration and planning with the MNRA towards this end. The NLUP also calls for specific collaboration through high level planning committees.	Para 5 pg. 58, para 4 pg. 62, pg 65-69, Table 10 pg 68-69, Budget 2b pg 72-73.
C2c. Largely Met	Reorganize the information presented in a work plan, incorporating key issues and institutions that will participate or lead the discussion of each key issue and include a timetable.	A table was created which identified the Critical issues in the REDD+, proposed activities for addressing these issues, the expected results of these activities, the partners and the timeframe.	Table 14 pg. 82-85
C2d. Met	The component is very well presented and clearly lays out the steps that will be taken during R-PP implementation to undertake the SESA process		

	and prepare the ESMF, and which body will have the oversight role – in this case the R+CU.		
C3. Largely Met	Provide a work plan for the reference level for deforestation and forest degradation that include the main driver elements described in component 2a.	Workplan provided in supplementary table.	Supplementary table C3
	It is suggested that a section be added that describes how the drivers will be dealt with in the reference level, particularly in relation to how to treat natural (e.g. hurricane) and anthropogenic drivers.	Section included in workplan (provided in supplementary table).	Supplementary table C3
C4a. Largely Met	Clarify how the impacts of the REDD+ strategy will be monitored.	The National Forest Information System, MRV System and Non-Carbon Monitoring System are all integral components of a process to monitoring the impacts of the REDD+ Strategies. The first two are meant to provide information on carbon benefits and effective reduction in forest degradation and deforestation. The latter is meant to address other benefits realized such as rural livelihoods, conservation of biodiversity and improved forest governance including social safeguards that are non-carbon related. There are four levels of monitoring, or monitoring bodies: the REDD+ Coordinating Unit, Technical Expert Group, the Readiness Activities Steering Committee, and the Belize National Climate Change Committee. The latter two are the highest decision making bodies along the chain, which will make decisions based on results made from monitoring at the other two levels (RCU & TEG). A Results Chain Mechanism (example attached) will also be developed by the RCU and form part of the regular reporting to the RASC, for effective monitoring of impacts.	Supplementary, supporting document.
	Give an outline of how the MRV system will provide feedback to other components during the implementation of the REDD+ strategy.	Results of the MRV System and other monitoring systems including those for social safeguards will be tabled as reports to the Readiness Activities Steering Committee who will then report to the Belize National Climate Change Committee through the Ministry of Forest, Fisheries and Sustainable Development. The information will be used for macro-level decision-making at the BNCCC level but also at the project implementation level at the Readiness Activities Steering	Supplementary, supporting document.

		Committee (RASC). Implications of MRV results for other components will be considered and addressed directly by the RASC. It will also consult with the Technical Expert Group (TEG) on the monitoring information as necessary. At the core of implementation, the REDD+ Coordination Unit will be the first to see and make the direct links between the MRV system and its connections with all other components and make recommendations upward for consideration and decision making.	
C4b. Met	This section has been substantially improved, attending to all the recommendations made in relation to the previous version. It would be appropriate to implement the activities in a sequential way, assigning priorities and thus developing a temporal plan.	Recommendations considered. Activities will be executed sequentially as is laid out in the document. The pre-design phase will focus initially on capacity building and awareness. This is followed by establishing a structure for the process through the Technical Expert Group (TEG) and the Standards Monitoring Group. Until the structure is set up will there be a focus on identifying national relevant indicators through an established process. There will then be consultation on the indicators to come up with a final list. Of course this is followed by implementation, monitoring and reporting to provide a feedback loop for further decision-making.	Pg 107-109
C5. Met	Please include the government and other sources of funding in the final summary as it is the budget for each component.	New budget tables included	Pg 112-114
C6. Met	The component has incorporated the recommendations previously made.		

Supplementary Table. Workplan for reference level for deforestation and degradation that describes how the main drivers will be dealt with in the reference level.

Reference Level Component	Available Data	Methodology	Expected Output
Historic Forest Cover Trends	Landsat TM/ETM+ images from 1980 to present in 5 year increments RapidEye high resolution satellite images 2011/2012	Supervised classification of Landsat images from 1980 to present to produce historic forest cover maps using expert knowledge and past classification datasets for signature development Supervised classification of RapidEye images with ground-truthing to produce high resolution forest type map for 2011/2012 which will be hybridized with the Landsat-based forest cover maps to produce historic forest type maps from 1980 to present The outputs of the RapidEye classification	Area of different forest types from 1980 to present, which will indicate the historic rate of loss of different forest types due to different deforestation agents.

		will include an assessment of land-use which will inform the area of forest lost due to different deforestation agents (listed in section 2a – and in particular largescale agriculture, slash and burn agriculture, cattle ranching, and urban expansion). The area of forest lost due to these agents over the reference period will be estimated	
Forest Carbon Stock	Data from over 1,000 temporary inventory plots (0.5 – 1 ha) in all the major forest types dating from circa 1970 to present Data from permanent sample plots (1 ha) in 7 of the major forest types dating from 1992 to present. Plots have been logged, affected	Robust estimates of mean standing aboveground carbon (AGC) for the major forest types will be estimated using local forest inventory data, supplementary data from global wood density databases and suitable allometric models (local and global). The mean	Historic emissions reference level from deforestation and degradation for different forest types and drivers.

| | by hurricane and fire | AGC stocks will then be applied to the area of the respective forest types to estimate historic trends in forest carbon stocks over the reference period according to the different deforestation agents.

Data from logged permanent sample plots will provide a means to estimate carbon stock change due to logging, hurricanes and fires. These change estimates will be applied to the area of forest logged, affected by hurricanes or burnt during the reference period in order to estimate a reference level for these natural and anthropogenic degradation agents. The area of forest logged, affected by hurricanes or | |
|---|---|---|---|

		burnt will be estimated from GIS/remote sensing analysis of logging activity, hurricane impacts, and fire scars.	