

Annex Two: Irregularities and issues with Asia-Pacific voting process

The issues that led to the decision to organize the re-vote in Asia were covered in the main report and will not be discussed again here. This annex will focus on the reasons why we made the decision to disqualify three of the Asia Pacific candidates.

On October 23rd BIC received two e-mail chains (see below) from Mr. Sajjad Ahmad of the Indus Sustainable Development Foundation (ISDF), one of the Asia-Pacific candidates, in which he accused another of the candidate organizations, Neo Nepal, of violating the electoral process. Closer examination of the e-mail chains reveals that discussions were in fact underway among three organizations, also including the Sustainable Development Centre (SDC), to exchange votes to support their candidatures for the UN-REDD and FCPF Observer seats respectively. There is a clear indication that votes were actively offered in support of each other's candidacies by all three organizations, and the presumed quid pro quo was only disrupted (and thus subsequently revealed to BIC) when it became clear to ISDF and SDC that Neo Nepal was offering them the same deal, essentially playing them off one against the other.

In response, BIC consulted international ethics experts to provide views and guidance. We were advised that active engagement in behind-the-scenes vote trading negotiations constituted a breach of ethical standards and integrity.

The objective of selecting an independent CSO representative is to uphold the standards that we are committed to, and to ensure that we have a representative with high ethics and standards so that this representative can objectively present CSO stakeholders' views and represent civil society on the UN-REDD Policy Board and the FCPF Participants Committee. The concept of integrity enshrined in the Charter of the United Nations embraces all aspects of behavior that a CSO representative should exhibit. The [International Standards of conduct for the international civil service](#) are also equally applicable to the standards of a CSO representative to an international body. It is incumbent on CSO representatives to adhere to high standards of conduct in line with the UN Charter and internationally accepted standards of ethics. If a representative was to be selected with a breach of integrity, our fundamental objective would be compromised.

Vote trading is a breach of ethical standards required for a trusted CSO representative. Any attempts to manipulate the voting process to secure personal gain are seen to go against the goal of supporting processes to reflect the un-coerced views of civil society stakeholders. For the reasons above, we made the decision to disqualify the organizations that participated in negotiations to trade votes (Neo Nepal, Sustainable Development Centre and, Indus Sustainable Development Foundation). Below are copied the e-mail chains that led us to the conclusions above.

1

Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal

From: Sajad Ahmad [sajad@isdf.pk]

Sent: Thursday, October 23, 2014 10:10 PM

To: 'PB Hamal'

Cc: 'Basanta Gautam'; jlichtenstein@bicusa.org; kanwar@sdcc.org.pk; arbarit@gmail.com;

alucvr_eid@yahoo.com; birkha.shahi1@gmail.com; basanta.gautam@arbonaut.com;

fecofun@wlink.com.np; neonepal98@yahoo.com; vanara@ngoforum.org;

zain@idosindh.org; hamidjavaidawan@gmail.com; zaindp@gmail.com

Subject: RE: Lolipop Cheating – Bilking Electoral Proces

Dear Padam,

I am not interested in this subject any more and don't need any clarification individually as things have already

been proved. For maintaining transparency and accountability, please keep all in communication loop and let every body know about the virus if you are interested.

Kind Regards,

Sajad

From: PB Hamal [mailto:hamalpb@gmail.com]

Sent: Thursday, October 23, 2014 9:14 PM

To: Sajad Ahmad

Cc: Basanta Gautam

Subject: Re: Lolipop Cheating – Bilking Electoral Proces

Dear Sajad,

Thank you for your interesting email. Who is virus in this regard. If you not familiar so I can give you details.

I would like to request you to send this mail again to all eligible voters against NEO Nepal.

Regards

Padam

On Thursday, October 23, 2014, Sajad Ahmad <sajad@isdf.pk> wrote:

(I am copying all so that everybody may take care of its votes and nominees)

Dear Padam,

It is quite interesting and strange that how you are trying to bilk the election process.

You informed me that Neo Nepal had already instructed their network to vote Mr. Sajad Ahmad for FCPF seeking support from me in favor of you for UNREDD.

(Email communication with me is attached herewith in pdf file)

After giving me a lollipop, you extended another lollipop to Mr. Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal finally that you have had instructed your network to vote Mr. Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal for UNREDD and seeking support from me for FCPF in favour of your godself (see below forwarded email communication with Mr. Kanwar Iqbal).

Assume now the following lollipop arrangements:

You (Mr. Padam Hamal) are assuming supportive votes from us as per following:

1. For UNREDD from Sajad Ahmad
2. For FCPF from Kanwar M. Javed Iqbal

You (Mr. Padam Hamal) declared categorically supporting us as below:

1. To Kanwar M. Javed Iqbal - for UNREDD
2. To Mr. Sajad Ahmad - for FCPF

How is it possible to support both of us in this way where Neo Nepal would be losing both seats, and it is also not guaranteed that you are also not cheating others at this moment which is not in our knowledge. We noticed this lollipop as we were in close collaboration during the voting process.

It seems Neo Nepal people want to be winners by all means which is a bad thing in the process and

purely cheating the system. Neo Nepal people want to grab the process in their favor by violating the fair rules and moral values of election process which is against ethics and rules and regulations. It is not bad to seek support or develop mutual understanding and partnership with different organizations. But, lollipop cheating is not acceptable which always meant to safeguard personal interests only.³

In short, Neo Nepal has depressed and disappointed us in the capacity of civil society organization with this lollipop cheating.

Kind regards,

Sajad Ahmad

Program Manager

Indus Sustainable Development Foundation

(Nominee: FCPF and UN-REDD Observer Asia)

From: Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal [mailto:kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com]

Sent: Thursday, October 23, 2014 5:4 PM

To: sajad@isdf.pk; Sajad Ahmad

Subject: Fwd: Neo Nepal Offer for UNREDD seat voting support

Dear Sajad,

Thanks God as we were in coordination otherwise we both have been lotted. See below communication of Neo

Nepal as they have offer for me for UNREDD seat while supporting you for FCPF. By the way, what would be

in their hand if they provide both to us.

Bests, Kanwar

----- Forwarded message ----- From: Basanta Gautam <basanta.gautam@arbonaut.com>

Date: Thu, Oct 23, 2014 at 7:03 AM

Subject: Re: Revoting Process for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats4

To: Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com>

Cc: PB Hamal <hamalpb@gmail.com>

Dear Kanwar,

I am sorry for my slow reply. I am at home in Pokhara, Nepal these days.

I just talked with Padam and agreed to instruct our network organisations to vote for you for your UNREDD

candidacy. We expect you to instruct your network to vote for us for our FCPF candidacy.

Let us hope that both of us will be selected from UNREDD and FCPF.

God luck and best regards,

Basanta

Sent from my iPhone

----- Forwarded message ----- From: NEO Nepal <ceo.neonepal@gmail.com>

Date: Tue, Oct 21, 2014 at 6:17 AM

Subject: Re: Revoting Proces for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats

To: Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com>

Dear Kanwar,

Thank you for your interested in UNREDD. I would like to inform you that I have network votes so I will discuss with Basanta then inform to you shortly.

Best Regards

Padam5

On Mon, Oct 20, 2014 at 1:21 PM, Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Padam,

Thanks so nice of you for thinking in this way to make success at each end. In fact I am interested in UNREDD

and therefore consumed many votes in my connection for it. What I can offer you is about 15 votes from

Pakistan stil intact for FCPF in case if you are interested. Please let me know the reverse of your proposal and

how much you can go for me.

Bests, Kanwar

On Mon, Oct 20, 2014 at 6:50 AM, NEO Nepal <ceo.neonepal@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Kanwar,

Thank you for your reply. Sory for late reply but We have god network so please discous with Basanta because he is authorized person of NEO Nepal.

Regards

Padam

On Sunday, October 19, 2014, Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Padam,

Thanks so nice of you. Can we have skype cal around 8pm in Pakistan and 8:30pm Nepal tonight. By the way,

how many votes you have in hand/ or can make sure so that we may think upon.

Bests, Kanwar

On Sun, Oct 19, 2014 at 5:20 PM, NEO Nepal <ceo.neonepal@gmail.com> wrote:6

Dear Kanwar,

Thank you for your masage. Iwould like to inform you that NEO Nepal is one of candidate to FCPF and UNREDD Asia seats. If you suport o NEO Nepal for UNREDD then NEO-Nepal wil you suport for FCPF. Ithink it would be beter for us.

Best Regards

Padam

-.....

(Padam Hamal)

Expert Member, Climate Change Council

under the Chairmanship of Rt Hon. Prime Minister of Nepal

Official Observer of the Climate Investment Funds (CIF)

Administrative Unit, Washington DC, USA

Webpage: www.climateinvestmentfunds.org

Nepal Coordinator, ENO Program Association, Joensuu, Finland

Mailing Address:

Chair of the Board

Neighbour Organization-Nepal

GPO Box 12483, Kathmandu, Nepal7

Tel/Fax: 00977 1 555 1735

Cell No: 00977 98510 41628

website: www.neonepal.org

From: Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com>;

To: NEO Nepal <neonepal@rocketmail.com>;

Subject: Revoting Proces for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats

Sent: Wed, Oct 15, 2014 8:07:57 AM

Hi Basanta,

BIC is re-doing voting proces for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats. They have provided justification that wo candidates were disqualified in the midle of election whereas there were skewed results issues. Now, BIC would run proces from its own database. I wonder if you have detailed information about it and how you

forese it. The re-voting will be run by today (as per working hours in USA).

Loking forward your eply.

Bests,

Kanwar

10/23/2014 Gmail - Fwd: Neo Nepal Offer for UNREDD seat voting support

<https://mail.google.com/mail/?ui=2&ik=3610d0d172&view=pt&search=inbox&th=1493d0906504b765&siml=1493d0906504b765> 1/3

Sajjad Ahmad <sajjad.isdf@gmail.com>

Fwd: Neo Nepal Offer for UNREDD seat voting support

1 message

Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com> Thu, Oct 23, 2014 at 5:44 PM

To: "sajjad@isdf.pk" <sajjad@isdf.pk>, Sajjad Ahmad <sajjad.isdf@gmail.com>

Dear Sajjad,

Thanks God as we were in coordination otherwise we both have been looted. See below communication of Neo

Nepal as they have offer for me for UNREDD seat while supporting you for FCPF. By the way, what would be in

their hand if they provide both to us.

Bests, Kanwar

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Basanta Gautam <basanta.gautam@arbonaut.com>

Date: Thu, Oct 23, 2014 at 7:03 AM

Subject: Re: Revoting Process for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats

To: Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com>

Cc: PB Hamal <hamalpb@gmail.com>

Dear Kanwar,

I am sorry for my slow reply. I am at home in Pokhara, Nepal these days.

I just talked with Padam and agreed to instruct our network organisations to vote for you for your UNREDD

candidacy. We expect you to instruct your network to vote for us for our FCPF candidacy.

Let us hope that both of us will be selected from UNREDD and FCPF.

Good luck and best regards,

Basanta

Sent from my iPhone

----- Forwarded message -----

From: NEO Nepal <ceo.neonepal@gmail.com>

Date: Tue, Oct 21, 2014 at 6:17 AM

Subject: Re: Revoting Process for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats

To: Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com>

Dear Kanwar,

Thank you for your interested in UNREDD. I would like to inform you that I have network votes so I will discuss

with Basanta then inform to you shortly.

Best Regards

Padam

On Mon, Oct 20, 2014 at 11:21 PM, Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Padam,

Thanks so nice of you for thinking in this way to make success at each end. Infact I am interested in UN-10/23/2014 Gmail - Fwd: Neo Nepal Offer for UNREDD seat voting support

<https://mail.google.com/mail/?ui=2&ik=3610d0d172&view=pt&search=inbox&th=1493d0906504b765&siml=1493d0906504b765> 2/3

REDD and therefore consumed many votes in my connection for it. What I can offer you is about 15 votes

from Pakistan still intact for FCPF in case if you are interested. Please let me know the reverse of your proposal and how much you can go for me.

Bests, Kanwar

On Mon, Oct 20, 2014 at 6:50 AM, NEO Nepal <ceo.neonepal@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Kanwar,

Thank you for your reply. Sorry for late reply but We have good network so please discous with Basanta because he is authorized person of NEO Nepal.

Regards

Padam

On Sunday, October 19, 2014, Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Padam,

Thanks so nice of you. Can we have skype call around 8pm in Pakistan and 8:30pm Nepal tonight. By the way, how many votes you have in hand/ or can make sure so that we may think upon.

Bests, Kanwar

On Sun, Oct 19, 2014 at 5:20 PM, NEO Nepal <ceo.neonepal@gmail.com> wrote:

Dear Kanwar,

Thank you for your massage. I would like to inform you that NEO Nepal is one of candidate to FCPF and UNREDD Asia seats. If you support to NEO Nepal for UNREDD then NEO-Nepal will you support for FCPF. I think it would be better for us.

Best Regards

Padam

--

.....

(Padam Hamal)

Expert Member, Climate Change Council

under the Chairmanship of Rt Hon. Prime Minister of Nepal

Official Observer of the Climate Investment Funds (CIF)

Administrative Unit, Washington DC, USA

Webpage: www.climateinvestmentfunds.org

Nepal Coordinator, ENO Program Association, Joensuu, Finland

Mailing Address:10/23/2014 Gmail - Fwd: Neo Nepal Offer for UNREDD seat voting support

<https://mail.google.com/mail/?ui=2&ik=3610d0d172&view=pt&search=inbox&th=1493d0906504b765&siml=1493d0906504b765> 3/3

Chair of the Board

Neighbour Organization-Nepal

GPO Box 12483, Kathmandu, Nepal

Tel/Fax: 00977 1 555 1735

Cell No: 00977 98510 41628

website: www.neonepal.org

From: Kanwar Muhammad Javed Iqbal <kanwar.javediqbal@gmail.com>;

To: NEO Nepal <neonepal@rocketmail.com>;

Subject: Revoting Process for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats

Sent: Wed, Oct 15, 2014 8:07:57 AM

Hi Basanta,

BIC is re-doing voting process for UNREDD and FCPF Asia seats. They have provided justification that two candidates were disqualified in the middle of election whereas there were skewed results issues. Now, BIC

would run process from its own database. I wonder if you have detailed information about it and how you foresee

it. The re-voting will be run by today (as per working hours in USA).

Looking forward your reply.

Bests,

Kanwar