



**FCPF Technical Advisory Panel**

**Argentina Draft R-PP:  
Initial comments by the TAP**

**March 22-25, 2010  
FCPF Participants Committee  
La Lope, Gabon**

**Lead reviewer for Argentina TAP review team:  
Eduardo Morales**

# Overall Summary of the Review: 1

- **Strengths of the RPP Document:**
- Consultation design that identifies sharing information (awareness raising) as a key first step.
- Deep analysis of the legislative context and the importance of the **Minimum Standard Forest Law (2007)** that has apparently curbed deforestation in Argentina
- Argentina has resolved issues of carbon ownership, created a National Fund (2% tax on ag exports), which will allow the country to move forward quickly in the design of a benefit sharing mechanism (fund used to pay forest conservationists++).
- Proposal clearly identifies the information that is missing for the development of a reference scenario and MRV system.

# Overall Summary of the Review: 2

## Issues of Concern from the TAP:

- Among the issues which will have to be largely improved is that of the **organizational arrangement of the REDD setup** in Argentina. The inter-agency collaboration will have to be worked through thoroughly and the responsibility of each party clearly indicated.
- The other issue that raised concerns is the Consultation Process in terms on **how the concerns raised by stakeholders will be taken into account and processed** as well as the way in which the Public Consultation and Disclosure Program will be managed.

# Overall Summary of the Review: 3

## Major Recommendations by the TAP:

- Given forest types diversity and communities socio-economic conditions, diversity in the causes of deforestation across ecoregions should be considered – regions should be treated separately for reference scenario and MRV.
- The structure of the Argentinean land tenure systems and mechanisms to conflict resolution between forestry and agricultural laws for instance must be improved as well as a benefit-sharing scheme that should be fair to the local communities.
- As noted in the RPP, create a national carbon accounting and reporting system including the accounting of environmental and social benefits.
- Create a mechanism to improve performance of the incentives based program, and implement a domestic incentive-based policy to tackle deforestation and set a road map to reduce deforestation and forest degradation balancing forest removals, in order to establish quantitative targets on scientific and empirical bases.

# R-PP Component 1: Organize and consult

## Standard 1a

## National Readiness Management Arrangements

### Assesment:

- The inner relationships between the structures to be created, are not completely clear. The way in which the organization has been designed may pose leadership conflicts.
- There are important sectors that are not represented in the REDD setup, such as: unions, family-based producers, small and medium rural producers, private organizations as the Rural Society and the Agrarian Federation, the academic sector, specially the absence of the National Agricultural Technology Institute and the National Council on Scientific and Technical Research.

### Recommendations:

- Clarify the organizational arrangement and indicate clearly the inter-agency collaboration and who would be responsible for what.
- A well described organogram showing the relationship between the National Working Group (GTN-REDD) and the rest of the participating organizations would be useful.

# R-PP Component 1: Organize and consult

## Standard 1b

## Stakeholder Consultation and Participation

### Assessment:

Presently there is no formalized arrangement in place to ensure an effective participation process for the government and relevant stakeholders. The understanding of this complexity should be much facilitated with a diagram or flowcharts representing the hierarchical arrangement of the system components and also their mutual relationships. The flower-shaped representation shown in page 15 does not capture that complexity. Responsibilities, tasks and tentative deadlines should accompany the schematic depiction of the C&PS.

### Recommendations:

- Clearly indicate how the consultation process would be undertaken.
- Identify the main preliminary concerns raised by stakeholders.
- The contents of the Public Consultation and Disclosure Program should be clarified.
- It is suggested that a diagram be included at the beginning of the section showing the main stakeholders and outlining the relation among them.

**Standard 1b: Ownership, transparency, and dissemination of the R-PP by the government and relevant stakeholders: Inclusiveness of effective and informed consultation and participation**

# R-PP Component 2: Prepare the REDD Strategy

## Standard 2a

## Assessment of Land Use, Forest Policy, and Governance

### Assessment

In the analysis of the causes of deforestation particular emphasis is put on the expansion of the soybean cropping neglecting the consideration of the expansion of agriculture; collection of firewood, charcoal production, railroad crossties tannins, and furniture manufacturing.

Abundant information is presented, for the soybean case, such information is disconnected from other sectors and fails to present a clear identification of the drivers for deforestation and degradation

### Recommendations: (Highlight these recommendations)

- Clearly identify and distinguish the drivers of deforestation and forest degradation
- Indicate past successes and failures in addressing deforestation and forest degradation; indicate how the failures will be addressed in this R-PP so that they are not repeated
- Discuss how the issues of poor enforcement are likely to be targeted going forward

**Standard 2a: identify major land use trends, direct and indirect DD drivers in the most relevant sectors in the context of REDD, and major land tenure and natural resource rights and relevant governance issues. Document past successes and failures**

# R-PP Component 2: Prepare the REDD Strategy

Standard 2b

REDD Strategy Options

## Assessment:

The report fails to propose a concrete strategy. It does not consider particular targets. The strategy proposal lacks of the identification and analysis of potential synergies with other country sector strategies. The risk of domestic leakage of greenhouse benefits is not assessed. The current strategy proposal should first be weighted, taking into account that some of the proposed goals (e.g., reduce the income of land use) are controversial.

## Recommendations: (Highlight these recommendations)

- Clearly identify what the country's REDD+ Strategy will be.
- Demonstrate how the REDD+ Strategy will be nested within the country's larger developmental framework.
- Conduct cost/benefit analyses of alternative economic activities

**Standard 2b: Alignment of the proposed REDD strategy with the identified drivers of deforestation and forest degradation, and with existing national and sectoral strategies: the R-PP should also include a summary of the emerging REDD strategy .**

# R-PP Component 2: Prepare the REDD Strategy

Standard 2c

REDD Implementation Framework

## Assessment

The regulatory background is not properly related to the implementation of the strategy, **it fails to present a work plan conducive to generate the institutional agreements** and arrangements required for the implementation of the strategy. Difficulties in adapting the current legislation and organizational setup to meet REDD's requirements are presented, although a partial solution is proposed.

## Recommendations:

- Elaborate the institutional arrangement for the implementation of REDD.
- Propose guidelines of a work plan conducive to generate the institutional agreements and arrangements required for the implementation of the strategy.
- Propose concrete implementation activities for the conforming of the legal and institutional frameworks

**Standard 2c: Elaborate institutional arrangements and issues relevant to REDD in the country setting that identifies key issues, and explores potential arrangements**

# R-PP Component 2: Prepare the REDD Strategy

Standard 2d

Assessment of Social and Environmental Impacts

## Assessment

This section does not contain any of the key elements for a strategic social and environmental assessment: goals, approaches and methodologies are not considered, nor are World Bank safeguard policies. It does not present an evaluation methodology on how to address the identified impacts aimed at reducing or minimizing adverse effects. Methodologies to be used for gathering the relevant information for this program and evaluating it are not described.

## Recommendations:

- Design a plan that will establish synergies among the various components.
- Consultation with indigenous communities must be treated as a dialogue-based process in order to acquire free consent from such communities pursuant to the provisions of ILO Convention No. 169.

Standard 2d: A Program of work for due diligence for strategic environmental and social impact assessment (SESAs) in compliance with the World Bank's safeguard policies

# R-PP Component 3: Develop a Reference Scenario

## Standard 3

## Reference scenario

### Assessment

The proposed work plan to develop the reference scenario to address deforestation it is not well analyzed. Three scenarios are defined: (1) 'optimistic' (full enforcement of the native forests law), (2) 'pessimistic' (non-enforcement of the native forests law), and (3) 'intermediate'. The sources of data used for building these scenarios are given, but the methodologies used for processing the data are not.

### Recommendations:

- Although information is given for the reduction of deforestation and related emissions, it is deemed that **the guidelines of a work plan for the development of a reference scenario** should be included.
- This section should be re-written with the purpose of identifying the actions to adopt over the next few years to develop a reference scenario.

**Standard 3: Work plan for how the reference scenario for REDD will be developed, including early ideas on feasibility of which methods to use; major data requirements and capacity needs, and linkages to the monitoring system design**

# R-PP Component 4: Design a monitoring system

## Standard 4

## Design a monitoring system

### Assessment

The R-PP report does not contain a proposal for the initial design of an integrated monitoring system of measurement, reporting and verification of deforestation and/or forest degradation. The proposed indicators are not relevant for monitoring social impacts and benefits. The Unsatisfied Basic Needs indicator is only surveyed every 10 years (upon Population and Housing National Censuses) and is quite scoped to the characteristics of the population's housing and other variables unrelated to the issue of REDD concern.

### Recommendations:

- Identify the capacity constraints and indicate how these will be addressed.
- Tasks description assigned to each member of GTN-REDD should be improved.
- A fully independent verification organization should be used. IRAM is an Argentinean organization that might have conflicting interests.

**Standard 4: Initial design of an integrated monitoring system of measurement, reporting and verification of changes in deforestation and/or forest degradation. Include early ideas on including capability to monitor other benefits and impacts, and to assess the impacts of the REDD strategy in the forest sector**

# R-PP Component 5: Schedule and Budget

## Standard 5

## Completeness of information and resource requirements

### Assessment

The document does not identify fund sources; funds requested from the FCPF, as well as from other international sources. The way in which the final table is structured does not provide information as to the funding from potential donors by year. **The total amount is \$5.4 million.**

The information presented does not reflect the priorities in the R-PP and will require further elaboration.

### Recommendations:

- Provide some justification for the amounts arrived at in the budgets.
- Indicate what would come from the FCPF and also indicate what existing funds are and what the new funds are.

**Standard 5: identifies capacity building and financial resources needed to accomplish the R-PP. A budget and schedule for funding and technical support requested from the FCPF, as well as from other international sources needs to be elaborated**

# R-PP Component 6: Design Program Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

Standard

Design a Program Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

## Assessment

No description or data is presented in this component.

## Recommendations:

- Provide some comments and possibly elaborate a Monitoring and Evaluation Framework of the R-PP itself.
- Prepare a detailed budget of this component.

**Standard 6: Describe the indicators that will be used to monitor program performance of the Readiness process and R-PP activities**

# Overall Summary

Component	1 a)	Standard not met
	1 b)	Standard not met
Component	2 a)	Standard not met
	2 b)	Standard only partially met
	2 c)	Standard only partially met
	2 d)	Standard only partially met
Component	3	Standard only partially met
Component	4	Standard only partially met
Component	5	Standard not met
Component	6	Standard not met