

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TFOA8880

## REDD Readiness preparation in Togo FCPFR - Forest Carbon Partnership Facility

Task Team Leader: 00000353536 - Manuela Ravina da Silva  
Approving Manager: 00000163235 - Maria Sarraf

Summary Information	
TF Status	ACTV
Recipient Country	Togo
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	9268 - SAWE1
Grant Start Date / End Date	03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021
Original Grant Amount	2,930,000.00
Grant Amount	2,930,000.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	2,857,592.17 as of 12/30/2021
Disbursed 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021	2,857,592.17
Donor	TF602001- MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Components, Outcome, Execution, Program (FCPFR), Disbursements.

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

## OVERVIEW

### Overall Assessments

#### Grant Objectives:

The development objective is to reinforce the Republic of Togo's capacity to design a socially and environmentally sound national strategy to reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation.

#### Overall progress from 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

##### Comment:

Overall progress towards achieving the grant development objective has been satisfactory.

The National REDD+ Strategy and its action plan<sup>1</sup> has been approved by the national REDD+ committee, along with the safeguards instruments and the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA)<sup>2</sup>. The REDD+ National Strategy and its action plan was adopted by the Council of Ministers in March 2021. The Togo REDD+ Readiness process demonstrated inclusive stakeholder engagement through stakeholder consultation and participation throughout the implementation of project activities and in the development of the National REDD+ Strategy, with more than 150 awareness-raising campaigns and capacity-building for over 29,640 beneficiaries (37% of whom are women).

#### Overall progress from 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

##### Comment:

All activities were implemented satisfactorily, namely; the establishment of REDD+ management bodies, and ensuring the operation and reinforcing the capacities of these, strengthening the capacities and organization of project stakeholders, the development and adoption by the Council of Ministers of the REDD+ strategy and action plan, safeguards instruments, carbon governance support tools, the development of a National Forest Monitoring System (NFMS), the establishment MRV institutional framework and operationalization, the development of the second national forest inventory, the national forest reference emission level (REL) which was validated by UNFCCC<sup>3</sup>. Togo also presented its self-assessment of progress towards REDD+ Readiness, its R-Package, to the FCPF Participants Committee in December 2021. **Only few actions which remain to be finalized** after project closure, namely: organization of the round table of donors on the REDD+ strategy and action plan; formalization of the **homologation manual** for REDD+ projects and initiatives; adoption of the decree on Strategic Environmental and Social Assessments (SESA) by the Government, **law** text on carbon governance and the benefit-sharing mechanism.

### Grant follow-up and structure

#### Description and context of Grant:

The AF was approved to help to fill financing gap of US\$2.93 million and: (i) ensure the operation and reinforcing the capacities of the national REDD+ management bodies to provide political and technical guidance to the development of the REDD+ Strategy; (ii) reinforce the capacities and organization of the main stakeholders for a more effective participation in the development and implementation of the REDD+ Strategy; (iii) finalizing the REDD+ Strategy with a detailed action plan; (iv) enhancing the efforts to consult, validate and disseminate the REDD+ strategy at local levels; (v) ensuring the integration of REDD+ into sectoral strategies and measures (vi) preparing the Government of Togo to access available funding from REDD+ mechanisms; and (vi) developing a National Forest Monitoring System (NFMS) and a Measurement, Reporting and Verification (MRV) system for REDD+ activities. By the end of the project, Togo it was also aimed to evaluate Togo's progress on REDD+ Readiness Preparation using the FCPF REDD+ Readiness Assessment Frameworks evaluation criteria and seek endorsement from the FCPF Participants Committee on the implementation arrangements developed for REDD+ (defined by the FCPF as the submission of a 'R-Package').

<sup>1</sup> <https://reddtogo.tg/index.php/ressources/strategie-nationale-redd/strategie>

<sup>2</sup> <https://reddtogo.tg/index.php/ressources/sauvegardes/evaluation-environnementale-et-sociale-strategiques>

<sup>3</sup> [https://redd.unfccc.int/files/nrf\\_togo\\_06\\_1\\_20\\_.pdf](https://redd.unfccc.int/files/nrf_togo_06_1_20_.pdf)

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

Expected follow up (if any): N/A

End Date of Last Site Visit: 17-20 December, 2021 (virtual)

## Restructuring of Grant:

In 2017 Togo self-assessed its REDD+ Readiness Preparation process using the FCPF REDD+ Readiness Assessment Framework's evaluation criteria and submitted the results to the 24<sup>th</sup> meeting of the FCPF Participants Committee (September 2017) through a Mid-Term Report (MTR). The MTR identified the remaining gaps and associated financial needs to complete the REDD+ Readiness Preparation process, resulting in Togo's request for an additional fund of US\$ 2.93 million from FCPF and extension of the project for 24 months with a new closing date for December 30, 2021.

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

## OUTCOME

### Comments on outcome achieved from 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021

Progress has been recorded with regards to achieving the grant objectives, as described previously. An institutional framework conducive to REDD+ process in place, which continues to be reinforced. The national REDD+ Strategy and SESA are finalized, approved by the National REDD+ Committee and adopted by the Council of Ministers this year.

### Grant Outcome Indicators

Grant outcome indicators are listed below.

#### Institutional framework conducive to REDD+ process in place

Baseline No  
Value:  
Date: 01/01/2015  
Progress to Yes  
Date: 12/31/2021  
Target Value: Yes  
Date: 12/31/2021

#### REDD+ strategy validated in broad consultation process

Baseline No  
Value:  
Date: 01/01/2015  
Progress to Date: Yes  
Date: 12/31/2021  
Target Value: Yes  
Date: 12/31/2021

#### Direct Project Beneficiaries

Baseline 0  
Value:  
Date: 01/01/2015  
Progress to Date: 29,640  
Date: 12/31/2021  
Target Value: 5,000  
Date: 12/31/2021

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

## COMPONENTS

### Output and Implementation by Component

#### Support to the national readiness management arrangements

Status: Completed

Planned Output: Institutions strengthened effectively coordinating and implementing REDD+ readiness with a grievance redress mechanism in place

Actual Output: Institutions strengthened and effectively coordinating REDD+ Readiness activities; grievance redress mechanism is finalized.

#### Support to REDD+ Strategy Preparation

Status: Completed

Planned Output: A National REDD+ Strategy incorporating SESA outcomes and recommendations is validated by national stakeholders. An ESMF for managing potential social and environmental risks is validated.

Actual Output: A REDD+ Strategy including SESA findings is finalized validated and adopted by the Council of Ministers in March 2021. The ESMF and other safeguards instruments are finalized.

### Comment on planned and actual Output

Activities were completed with good overall progress.

### Comment on component implementation progress

#### Component 1: Support to the national readiness management arrangements

The REDD+ management bodies have been established and are operating, including the REDD+ National Committee, the REDD+ National Working Group and the REDD+ regional focal points in the country's five regions. The Prefectural Commissions for Sustainable Development (Commissions Préfectorales de Développement Durable, CPDDs) have been set up and made operational in 35 prefectures. Civil society platforms have been established and/or strengthened to contribute to the REDD+ process and carry out activities at the grassroot level. The additional finance supported and strengthened the capacity of these structures to enhance the participation and consultations around the development of the REDD+ Strategy and to prepare them for the future implementation of REDD+. The Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM) has been finalized.

#### Component 2: Support to REDD+ Strategy Preparation

The national REDD+ Strategy including a detailed costed action plan for its implementation, the SESA and accompanying safeguards instruments have been approved and disclosed in country and at the World Bank's website. The national REDD+ strategy was approved by the National REDD+ Committee and adopted by the Council of Ministers in March 2021. REDD+ has in the meantime been enshrined in Togo's National Development Plan (NDP) which covers the 2018-2022 period.

A few activities were noted to be finalized after project closure (March 2022), namely; The organization of the donors' roundtable on the REDD+ strategy and action plan; (ii) the formalization of the certification manual for REDD+ projects and initiatives; (iii) the adoption of the decree on Strategic Environmental and Social Assessments (SESA) by the Government in the Council of Ministers, the text governing carbon governance and the benefit-sharing mechanism by December 31, 2022.

#### Component 3. Support to the establishment of a Forest Reference Emissions Level - FREL

Activities related to the development of the NRF progressed well. The FREL report was prepared and assessed by the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) in April 2020. The UNFCCC experts have given their positive opinion and the final assessment report is being prepared.

The second National Forest Inventory (NFI) was conducted and the report is being finalized. The mission took note of the proposed schedule for the final analysis of the second NFI data and the production and validation of the report at the end of December 2021.

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

## Component 4. Support to the development of monitoring systems for forests and safeguards

The National Forest Monitoring System (NFMS)<sup>4</sup> group was strengthened and is operational. The institutional arrangement for the NFMS is developed and formalized by decree and orders. The mission noted that the central server of the Ministry of the Environment is not operational, which limits the deployment of the NFMS on this server. To operationalize the NFMS and manage the forestry and cartographic database, the coordination, with the support of an expert, has developed forest monitoring tools (Collect Earth) on the FAO servers. Permanent plots for land monitoring are set up (<https://collect.earth/collection?projectId=27597>). The forest monitoring team is currently processing these 4,000 plots.

The mission recommended the continuation of the processing of these plots to update the land use situation for the effective operationalization of the Satellite Land Monitoring System (SLMS) within the framework of the implementation of the NFMS. This activity will therefore continue after project closure and is expected to be finalized by March 2022, including updated national forest cover maps for the period 2018-2020.

Safeguards Information System (SIS) is in place with a national REDD+ registry and an accreditation manual for REDD+ projects and initiatives. These tools have been shared and validated nationally. Capacity building is also carried out with the system's key players.

## EXECUTION

### Bank project related to the grant

**Project ID / Name:** P149942 - REDD Readiness preparation in Togo  
**Project Status:** Lending  
**Global Focal Area:** Climate change  
**Product Line:** CN - Carbon Offset

## Implementing agency and contact details

**Agency:** The Ministry of Environment and Forest Resources  
**Contact:** Pyoabalo Alaba  
**Address:** 20 Rue des Evala  
**Phone:** (228) 22 51 42 17  
**Website:** [www.odef.tg](http://www.odef.tg)  
**Email:** [odefdirection@gmail.com](mailto:odefdirection@gmail.com)

## PROGRAM

### Program Specific Questions

#### 1. Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+ -related initiatives, including those funded by

FCPF activities are coordinated with those of the GIZ, who also financed REDD+ Readiness with a focus on the national forest inventory and inputs that would be useful for the future development of the Forest Reference Emissions Level (FREL). The GIZ support has since ended, and the additional finance was built on this work. Collaboration was also started with FAO to support the operationalization of the Forest Monitoring system, adopting FAO's SEPAL/Collect Earth cloud solutions for migration of forest reference level data and development of satellite imagery.

<sup>4</sup> <https://ogardi.github.io/SNSF-Togo/>

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

## 2. Describe any important changes in the technical design or approach related to the Grant activities.

N/A

## 3. Describe progress in addressing key capacity issues (implementation, technical, financial management, procurement) related to this Grant.

A consortium of consultants (international and national) provided strategic and technical support to the REDD+ Coordination and strengthen the capacity of the team. Following the World Bank's in-depth fiduciary review, the new project Coordinator and fiduciary team have been in place since June and November 2019, respectively. The communications specialist was also replaced and a new social development specialist added to the team to reinforce capacity on social issues.

## 4. Describe progress in addressing social and environmental issues (including safeguards) related to the Grant. Is the SESA conducted in accordance with the Common Approach?

Yes, the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA) and safeguards instruments are in accordance with World Bank safeguard policies, which are in line with the Common Approach.

## 5. Is the ESMF prepared in accordance with the Common Approach?

Yes, the ESMF is in accordance with World Bank safeguard policies, which are in line with the Common Approach.

## 6. Describe progress in stakeholder consultation, participation, disclosure of information, and the FGRM related to this Grant.

The major deliverables of this Grant are consulted and validated in a participatory manner at national, regional and prefectural levels (the major administrative levels of the country), including with an active participation of the civil society platforms engaged in the REDD+ process. A communications strategy ensures the effective distribution and access to information for the various REDD+ stakeholders. A GRM has been developed for the readiness phase, and a GRM is finalized for the future implementation of the REDD+ Strategy.

## COMPLETION

### Overall Assessments and Lessons Learned

#### Main lessons learned:

A number of positive points were noted during the implementation process. These included:

- The involvement of civil society organizations in the direct implementation of certain consultation and awareness-raising activities. This not only allowed the project to test their effectiveness in the conduct of future REDD+ projects and actions, but also to involve them more closely in the process;
- Conducting technical activities through the direct involvement of nationals and support capacity strengthening. These include (i) national forest inventories, the first of which was supported by external expertise and the second carried out by nationals; (ii) mapping and remote sensing for land use and occupation analyses and (iii) the development of forest reference levels, which are carried out and developed by nationals with the support of international technical assistance.
- Analytical studies and consultations were carried out iteratively from the bottom up (local and national), involving all stakeholders.
- However, some gaps included the infrequency of meetings of the national REDD+ committee made up of authorities at the highest level and the lack of pilot activities to encourage and demonstrate the application of REDD+ strategic options in the field.

#### Overall outcome (and its Sustainability):

##### Comment:

The REDD+ Readiness project supported the establishment of the main REDD+ institutions and tools needed to move Togo towards investment phase, including investments and the preparations for the potential results-based payments. The project achieved to put in place safeguard instruments, Feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanism, Measurement, Reporting and Verification System, and FREL. The grant financed activities supported also the enhancement of the REDD+ dialogue and drivers of deforestation and forest degradation; it increased cooperation between the forestry sector and other stakeholders such as CSO

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

groups, and other sectors that are at the root of deforestation and forest degradation (agriculture, urban, energy).

## Bank Performance:

### *Comment:*

The overall Bank Performance is Satisfactory. Regular supervision missions were organized and documented in Aide-Memoires, Non-Objections were provided to the client under reasonable timeframes, and regular reporting was done to the Bank and donors. The Bank team supported the client with technical advice throughout implementation of the grant financed activities.

## Additional Assessment

### Development / strengthening of institutions:

#### *Comment:*

The capacity of the Ministry of Environment and Forest Resources (in french: Ministère de l'Environnement et des Ressources Forestières (MERF), the Forestry Development and Exploitation Office, the National Environmental Agency, and Civil Society Platforms were strengthened on REDD+ and environmental and social safeguards thanks to the grant support. The National REDD+ management institutions (REDD+ National Committee, the REDD+ National Working Group and the REDD+ regional focal points in the country's five regions) improved a capacity for managing the national REDD+ process.

### Mobilization of other resources:

#### *Comment:*

GIZ supported Togo with the Readiness and Rehabilitation of Forests in Togo REDD+ support program ("ProREDD"), covering an initial phase for the period 2014-2016 and a second phase for the period 2017-2019. Green Climate Fund (GCF) proposals were also developed in collaboration with the designated national authority of the Green Climate Fund and the World Bank. Despite efforts to ensure sustainability on continuation towards investment phase, the Ministry of Environment and Forest Resources is still open and in search of mobilizing resources to advance towards the implementation of the REDD+ strategy and its action plan.

### Knowledge exchange:

#### *Comment:*

The Togo REDD+ team has been a part of various learning events on REDD+ supported by the FCPF and other sources.

### Client's policy / program implementation:

#### *Comment:*

MERF continues pursuing key policy recommendations coming out of the National REDD+ Strategy and maintains dialogue with key sectors interfacing with forestry - land planning, agriculture, and mining.

### Efficiency:

#### *Comment:*

Planned project outcomes were achieved in a timely manner, thus efficiency is rated satisfactory.

### Replicability:

#### *Comment:*

The REDD+ readiness support ensured the dialogue on deforestation; forest degradation sustainable land management and reforestation needs in the country. Despite efforts to ensure sustainability on continuation towards investment phase, the Ministry of Environment and Forest Resources is still open and in search of mobilizing resources to advance towards the implementation of the REDD+ strategy and its action plan.



# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Report to Donor

Ref. TFOA8880  
Printed On: 06/23/2023

Reporting Period: 03/27/2019 to 12/31/2021  
Report Type: Completion Report  
Report Status: Approved

## Main recommendations to stakeholders:

Based on the achievements and lessons learned from implementation of this project, the following are recommended to stakeholders:

1. Awareness raising, and strengthened coordination among decision makers, such as relevant Ministries is important and should be continued to consolidate gains in Readiness implementation and support future investment phase for Togo.
2. Awareness raising and communication is also important and should be continued at community level to create synergies of REDD+ activities, including finalization of benefit sharing plan with proper communication on the share of co-benefits should there be a continuation of an investment phase.
3. Continuous training and capacity building for stakeholders including the Government, community leaders, farmers, farmer groups and private sector on environmental and social safeguards implementation is key to manage social and environmental risks.
4. MRV capacity was enhanced thanks to good engagement and collaboration of national stakeholders and technical assistance support which resulted in building a national forest monitoring system. To ensure improvement and continuation of the national forest monitoring activities, a small team in MRV REDD+ activities should be established after project closure.
5. Togo was not in the FCPF Carbon Fund portfolio. To support a new engagement on investment phase and ensure it contributes to Togo's political ambition to increase forest cover to 30 percent by 2050, a roundtable of donors should be organized.

## Main recommendations to Bank Management:

The World Bank through FCPF was crucial to support Togo for future REDD+ investment phase. There is currently no other engagement to continue supporting Togo towards implementing REDD+ National Strategy and its action plan and support the political aims to increase forest cover by 30% by 2050. To ensure sustainability of what was already built and established in Togo through the readiness phase, and given the important results on strong community engagement in REDD+ activities, including alarming deforestation and forest degradation rates, the World Bank should consider to continue the engagement with the Government of Togo on investing in forestry operation, and supporting reforestation investments and sustainable land management, to build resilience among communities and enhance climate change mitigation.

## DISBURSEMENTS

### Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
7/1/2019	6/30/2020	0	0	508,746.85	508,746.85
7/1/2020	06/30/2021	0	0	1,403,789.69	895,042.84
7/1/2021	06/30/2022	0	0	2,896,597.81	1,492,808.12
7/1/2022	06/30/2023	0	0	2,857,592.17	-39,005.64