

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

## Report to Donor

Ref. TF0A0984  
Printed On: 7/1/2021

Reporting Period: 07/01/2019 to 06/30/2020  
Report Type: Progress Report  
Report Status: Approved

Assignment: TF0A0984

## Thailand - FCPF Readiness Preparation Proposal FCPFR - Forest Carbon Partnership Facility

Task Team Leader: 00000186457 - Lan Thi Thu Nguyen  
Approving Manager: 00000175113 - Mona Sur

Summary Information	
TF Status	ACTV
Recipient Country	Thailand
Executed By	Recipient
Managing Unit	9532 - SEAE2
Grant Start Date / End Date	06/17/2016 to 12/31/2021
Original Grant Amount	3,600,000.00
Grant Amount	3,600,000.00
Outstanding Commitments	0.00
Cumulative Disbursements	1,686,976.42 (46.9%) as of 06/30/2020
Disbursed 07/01/2019 to 06/30/2020	621,740.92
Donor	TF602001 - MULTIPLE DONORS

This GRM report includes the following sections: Overview, Components, Outcome, Execution, Program (FCPFR), Disbursements.

## OVERVIEW

### Overall Assessments

#### Grant Objectives:

The Project Development Objective is to support the development of the Readiness Preparation Activities. This will be achieved by supporting the preparation of its REDD+ strategy, the design of a national MRV system, and by producing technical work and policy advice.

#### Overall progress from 07/01/2019 to 06/30/2020 with regard to Achieving Grant Objectives:

##### Comment:

The objective of the Grant is to support the development of the Readiness Preparation Activities. This will be achieved by supporting the preparation of the Recipient's REDD+ strategy, the design of a national MRV system, and by producing technical work and policy advice. The Governments has maintained strong commitment to REDD+ as demonstrated by active participation in international processes around REDD+ within the global FCPF partnership and beyond. Over the past year, substantial progress has been made to all of the grant activities, including signing contracts for all of the large consultancy packages and quality initial results of these packages. However, staff shortages and changes of key staff in the REDD+ Office have posed significant bottlenecks, especially in performing technical review when the large package deliverables are due such as REDD strategy, SESA, MRV and REL work. It was discussed and agreed with DNP that additional support is needed including mobilization of technical expertise from the Steering Committee and technical review consultant.

More broadly, the Government remains committed to advancing with REDD+ readiness preparation with the longer-term objective to become ready to participate in and benefit from emerging performance-based payment systems from REDD+ within the context of the UNFCCC. The grant activities aim to develop or enhance socially and environmentally sound policies and interventions to reduce deforestation and forest degradation, establish internationally recognized reference emission level, design technically robust systems for forest monitoring and reporting. This REDD+ readiness preparation grant assists the Government of Thailand in preparing a comprehensive national REDD+ strategy and aims to coordinate forest-friendly land use planning across the landscape.

## Overall progress from 07/01/2019 to 06/30/2020 with regard to Implementation of Grant Financed Activities:

### Comment:

Implementation has been slower than anticipated due to i) a long-time shortage of staffing for project implementation in DNP; ii) poor performance of the consulting firm under the largest and key package leading to non-deliverables; and iii) COVID-19 impact on field work including consultation activities. Nevertheless, progress has been made following the change in leadership of the Office of Forests and Climate Change and the broader reorganization with DNP as well as restructuring of the non-performing package. Disbursement has increased significantly including initial payments upon effectiveness of major consultant firm contracts for which contracts were signed and results are delivered. Disbursement to date reaches 47% of the total grant amount.

Performance is rated as Moderately Satisfactory during the reporting period, with significant progress seen in the last year. Activities have largely been completed by June 30, 2020 except for completion of the National REDD+ Strategy, the Benefit Sharing Mechanism, the Safeguards Information System and the first-ever Strategic Environment and Social Assessment (SESA) for forestry sector which need much longer time to complete. These deliverables are under the work package CS-6 with a poor performing consulting firm. The Grant closing date was extended by 18 months from June 30, 2020 to December 31, 2021 to enable the Thailand Gov. to complete these critical deliverables. Of the key results of the project, the followings have been completed: i) established institutional arrangements and strengthened capacity for REDD+ implementation; ii) established credible Reference Emission Level against which to measure future emission reductions; iii) putting in place a comprehensive and credible MRV system for GHG emissions and Co-Benefits; and iv) inputs into the National REDD+ Strategy including the assessments of drivers of deforestation and forest degradations and recommendations.

The Mid-term Progress Report was prepared and endorsed by FMT to be presented at the PC meeting in the Fall, 2020.

## Grant follow-up and structure

Description and context of Grant: NA

Expected follow up (if any): Follow up Bank project/loan/credit/grant

### Comment on follow up:

- Alternative measures are to be agreed to speed up the implementation of the CS-6 package.
- Additional technical review expertise to be mobilized or contracted to perform the review of large package deliverables. All activities under the large packages will require DNP's close monitoring and quality assurance. The contracted consultant to review the CS6 Package deliverables will work closely with DNP technical staff, members of the various working groups and relevant steering committee members for best results.

End Date of Last Site Visit: NA

### Restructuring of Grant:

The Grant closing date was extended by 18 months to allow the delivery of the grant results. The new closing date is December 31, 2021.

## OUTCOME

### Comments on outcome achieved from 07/01/2019 to 06/30/2020

- Capacity on REDD+ readiness is continuously enhanced with the establishment of regional REDD offices
- REDD+ readiness preparation in terms of capacity building, communication, MRV, safeguards, and legal frameworks was improved
- Key results of the project have been completed, including: i) established institutional arrangements and strengthened

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

capacity for REDD+ implementation; ii) established credible Reference Emission Level against which to measure future emission reductions; iii) putting in place a comprehensive and credible MRV system for GHG emissions and Co-Benefits; and iv) inputs into the National REDD+ Strategy including the assessments of drivers of deforestation and forest degradations and recommendations.

## Grant Outcome Indicators

No Outcome indicators are defined or used for this grant.

## COMPONENTS

### Output and Implementation by Component

#### Support readiness organization and consultation

<b>Status:</b>	Completed
<b>Planned Output:</b>	National REDD+ readiness institutional arrangements, REDD+ Regional Offices established, Outreach program, capacity building and info dissemination
<b>Actual Output:</b>	National REDD+ readiness institutional arrangements, REDD+ Regional Offices established, Outreach program, capacity building and info dissemination

#### REDD+ Strategy Preparation

<b>Status:</b>	Under Implementation
<b>Planned Output:</b>	REDD+ strategy incl. identification of drivers and causes of D&D and respective REDD options, SESA , ESMF; Feedback and GRM
<b>Actual Output:</b>	REDD+ strategy incl. identification of drivers and causes of D&D and respective REDD options, SESA , ESMF; Feedback and GRM

#### Forest Monitoring and Emissions

<b>Status:</b>	Under implementation
<b>Planned Output:</b>	Developed reference emission level (#REL#) and monitoring, reporting and verification system (MRV)
<b>Actual Output:</b>	Developed reference emission level (#REL#) and monitoring, reporting and verification system (MRV)

#### Project Management, Monitoring and Evaluation Framework

<b>Status:</b>	Under Implementation
<b>Planned Output:</b>	Well functional management and coordination of REDD readiness activities
<b>Actual Output:</b>	Well functional management and coordination of REDD readiness activities

## Comment on planned and actual Output Comment on component implementation progress

Component 1: Support Readiness Organization and Consultation. Activities under this component provide support to strengthening national REDD+ readiness institutional arrangements and consultations, including: supporting the establishment and/or operationalization of various partners involved in REDD+ process, including, particularly, the National REDD+ Office and Regional REDD+ Units; developing outreach mechanisms through consultations and communications strategy; developing and implementing REDD+ outreach programs for relevant stakeholders including civil society organizations, forest-dependent local communities, ethnic minorities and youth; establishing and operationalizing technical, stakeholder and cross-sectorial working groups; and publicly disseminating the SESA work. Under this component, the following activities have been carried out:

- About two hundred representatives from the upper Northern, Central, Western, and Eastern regions were trained on REDD+ Framework.
- Sharing information and knowledge on REDD+ Framework to related stakeholder at the eight forest and climate change education and action centers in 5 regions.
- Establishment of the REDD+ Regional Office in the North Eastern region. Offices in other regions are in process for management approval.
- A Communication and outreach strategy was completed with high quality. The workshop on dissemination of the REDD+

# World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

Communication Strategy has been planned to organize for the target groups/REDD+ network (for about 100 stakeholders)

- The workshop on dissemination of the FREL/FRL has been planned to organize for the target groups (for about 100 stakeholders)
- Four training workshops related to enhancing knowledge of benefit sharing on REDD+ concept have been planned to organize in 4 regions for about 200 stakeholders. Under this component, the following activities have been achieved during the reporting period:

**Component 2:** Activities under this component support the development of a REDD+ strategy including: supporting analytical work to inform REDD+ strategy development; conducting consultations and studies on key issues related to REDD+, including, identifying drivers and underlying causes of deforestation and forest degradation and respective REDD+ strategy options, forest governance, land tenure, and benefit sharing arrangements; undertaking the SESA and preparing an Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF); reviewing existing Feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanisms (FGRMs), and as necessary, establishing or strengthening the FGRM(s); designing a safeguard monitoring system; and supporting the elaboration of the draft REDD+ strategy.

**CS-6 Package:** The CS-6 Contract for REDD+ National Strategy was signed on 12 June 2019. This package has not been completed as expected. Many of the issues relating to timing and sequencing of the deliverables were far behind schedule. The performance of the consulting firm poor and all reports were unqualified.

**Component 3:** Forest Monitoring and Emissions.

Activities under this component support the development of a reference emission level (“REL”) and monitoring, reporting and verification system (“MRV”) , including: supporting the establishment of a REL by, inter alia, reviewing, compiling, analyzing information and developing a national REL estimate; providing technical support to, inter alia, develop models for emissions estimations; supporting the technical design and proposal for enhancing the national forest inventory and monitoring system to support REDD+; compiling, analyzing and disseminating information on the latest national forest inventory; and providing training to government officials and other stakeholders in MRV and software programming. Progress under this component includes:

- DNP signed agreement with FAO for “Technical Assistance for the Development of REDD+MRV system and Forest Reference Level for Thailand” on 6 September 2018. The agreement is to be completed by September 30, 2020, according to the ToRs.
- The implementation of this work package is well on track and the forest reference emission levels and forest reference levels (FREL/FRL) report was submitted for review by the REDD+ Task Force Committee; the Subcommittee on Climate Change Policy and Planning Integration; and the National Committee on Climate Change Policy (NCCC), following the approval by these committee, the FREL/FRL report would be submitted to UNFCCC for technical assessment.

**Component 4:** Activities under this component support the management and coordination of REDD readiness activities, financial and procurement services, as well as monitoring and coordination of the overall operation.

## EXECUTION

### Bank project related to the grant

**Project ID / Name:** P130115 - TH FCPF Readiness Preparation Project  
**Project Status:** Lending  
**Global Focal Area:** Climate change  
**Product Line:** CN - Carbon Offset

### Implementing agency and contact details

**Agency:** Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, Division of Foreign Affairs  
**Contact:** Dr. Prasert Sornsathapornkul  
**Address:** Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, Division of Foreign Affairs  
**Phone:** 025610777 **Email:** ps\_dnp@yahoo.com  
**Website:**

## PROGRAM

### Program Specific Questions

**1. Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+-related initiatives, including those funded by Describe progress in how the Grant activities are being coordinated with other REDD+-related initiatives, including those f**

REDD+ grant activities will be coordinated with other related initiatives via the REDD+ Task Force, which was established for the purpose of inter-ministerial and multi-sectoral coordination. The REDD+ Task Force includes governmental and non-governmental representation. The development of a action plan for 2018-20 has ensured that grant activities are coordinated with other ongoing related activities and initiatives in the country.

**2. Describe any important changes in the technical design or approach related to the Grant activities.**

There have been no significant changes to technical design of grant activities

**3. Describe progress in addressing key capacity issues (implementation, technical, financial management, procurement) related to this Grant.**

The assignment of a new coordinator has significantly improved overall grant implementation progress. Further, a financial officer from the DNP has been assigned to maintain and operate project financial and accounting transactions in accordance with the Thailand Accounting Standards and relevant government guidelines. Support on procurement and FM was mobilized within the DNP and has improved the implementation progress

**4. Describe progress in addressing social and environmental issues (including safeguards) related to the Grant. Is the SESA conducted in accordance with the Common Approach?**

Training on the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA), a safeguards instrument specific to REDD+ readiness, has been conducted by the Bank's team during the reporting period. The SESA which is being developed will be in accordance with the Common Approach

**5. Is the ESMF prepared in accordance with the Common Approach?**

Yes.

**6. Describe progress in stakeholder consultation, participation, disclosure of information, and the FGRM related to this Grant.**

The project is led by the Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plan Conservation (DNP) under the Division of Foreign Affairs within the Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment. Responsibility of REDD+ implementation lies with the Office of Forests and Climate Change. Two consultation events with CSOs were held to support the formation of stakeholder working groups. Further, training on the REDD+ readiness for communities and NGOs has been carried out in the Northern, Central and North-Eastern regions of the country during the reporting period.

## DISBURSEMENT

### Disbursements Summary in USD

Date From	Date To	Planned Cumulative	Planned Period	Actual Cumulative	Actual Period
01/01/2016	06/30/2016	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
07/01/2016	12/31/2016	0.00	0.00	300,000.00	300,000.00
01/01/2017	06/30/2017	0.00	0.00	300,000.00	0.00
07/01/2017	12/31/2017	0.00	0.00	300,000.00	0.00
01/01/2018	06/30/2018	0.00	0.00	331,709.40	31,709.40
07/01/2018	12/31/2018	0.00	0.00	1,053,245.11	721,535.71
01/01/2019	06/30/2019	0.00	0.00	1,065,235.50	11,990.39

## World Bank - Grant Reporting and Monitoring (GRM) Report

07/01/2019	12/31/2019	0.00	0.00	1,416,659.86	351,424.36
01/01/2020	06/30/2020	0.00	0.00	1,686,976.42	270,316.56
07/01/2020	12/31/2020	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00