



THAILAND: REDD+ Country Participant Completion Report

FCPF REDD+ Readiness Fund

Submission Date: June 30, 2022

Project Name	Thailand Readiness Preparation Proposal (TF0A0984)
Country	Thailand
Implementing Agency	Department of National Parks, Wildlife, and Plant Conservation (DNP)
Grant Objectives	The Project Objective is to support the development of the Readiness Preparation Activities for the implementation of REDD+ mechanism in Thailand. This will be achieved by supporting the preparation of its REDD+ strategy, the design of a national MRV system, and by producing technical work and policy advice.
Original Amount (US\$)	US\$ 3,600,000
Revised Amount (US\$)	-
Actual Disbursed (US\$)	US\$ 2,776,018.25
Effectiveness Date	June 17, 2016
Original Closing Date	November 30, 2019
Actual Closing Date	December 31, 2021

1. Overall Outcome and its Sustainability

There were 4 components under the Readiness Preparation Activities which implemented as followings:

- Component 1: Readiness Organization and Consultation
- Component 2: REDD+ Strategy Preparation
- Component 3: Forest Monitoring and Emission
- Component 4: Project Management Monitoring, and Evaluation Framework

The DNP maintained strong commitment to the preparation of REDD+ mechanism as demonstrated by participation in international processes on REDD+ within the global FCPF partnership and beyond. Over the past years, substantial progress has been created deliberately to implement all of the grant activities, including completing core packages, i.e., Thailand REDD+ Strategy establishment; the development of REDD+ MRV system and Forest Reference Level for Thailand; and Communication Strategy Plan. The DNP also established 9 forest and climate change education centers to be part of the preparation of the REDD+ mechanism development and future implementation. Capacity building and networking on REDD+ framework at the central and regional level has been established and strengthened. The draft report of Thailand REDD+ strategy was completed and successful reviewed by the WB team and experts from Thailand and international; and will be processed for

further endorsement by the National Committee on Climate Change Policy. The report of forest reference emission levels and forest reference levels (FREL/FRL) was submitted to the UNFCCC for the Technical Assessment (TA) of 2021, and was successfully reviewed by the TA team.

2. Outcome of each Readiness Grant Activity

Component 1: Support Readiness Organization and Consultation. Activities under this component provided support to strengthening national REDD+ readiness institutional arrangements and consultations, including: supporting the establishment and/or operationalization of various partners involved in REDD+ process, including, particularly, the National REDD+ Office and Regional REDD+ Units; developing outreach mechanisms through consultations and communications strategy; developing and implementing REDD+ outreach programs for relevant stakeholders including civil society organizations, forest-dependent local communities, ethnic minorities and youth; establishing and operationalizing technical, stakeholder and cross-sectorial working groups; and publicly disseminating the SESA work. Under this component, the following outcomes were realized:

- DNP consolidated teams of experts, together with the external consultants to support the preparation of the National REDD+ Strategy.
- The following Technical Working Groups were established for technical review and provide guidance on related activities.
 - Project Steering Committee on Thailand REDD+ Readiness Preparation Proposal (R-PP);
 - REDD+ Task Force Committee; and
 - Technical Working Group on National REDD+ Strategy.
- Establishment of 9 forest and climate change education and action centers and a REDD+ database center at the central office.
- Developing a 3-year National REDD+ Communication Strategy Plan by using varieties of media (publication, multimedia and social media) in conjunction with the communications in the DNP and related government agencies.
- Information sharing and learning activities on the REDD+ framework was carried out at the nine forest and climate change learning and action centers in all 5 regions to strengthen stakeholders' awareness and knowledge.
- Among the international REDD+ and Climate Change related meetings attended by the DNP's officials:
 - Two DNP officials were supported to participate in a knowledge exchange workshop on FREL/FRL development in India which organized by FAO/UN-REDD.
 - Supporting 5 DNP and 1 RFD officials to attend consultation meeting on REDD+ Reference Level and Measurement/Monitoring/Reporting System in Italy.
 - Supporting DNP participated in the 25th UN Climate Change Conference of the Parties (COP25).
 - Supporting DNP participated in the 26th UN Climate Change Conference of the Parties (COP26).
- Capacity Building for DNP's officials and related stakeholders was organized:
 - Two south-south knowledge exchange study trips, on REDD+ implementation, were conducted in Indonesia and Vietnam with participation of 32 DNP officials.
 - 520 persons/stakeholders from 9 regional offices were trained on the REDD+ framework: a training course on REDD+ framework and Forest Climate Change; and a

- workshop on Building awareness, lessons learned, and formulating a plan on REDD+ and Forest Climate Change.
- A workshop on Dissemination of Thailand Baseline for FREL/FRL were organized and there were 79 persons participated in this workshop.
 - DNP and FOA organized 2 workshops and 1 training course: 1) the MMR/NFMS Consultation workshop for Thailand; 2) the workshop on REDD+ Forest Reference Level (FRL) Capacity Building for Thailand; and 3) the training course on System for Earth Observation Data Access, Processing and Analysis for Land Monitoring (SEPAL) for DNP officials.
 - The workshops on Dissemination of the REDD+ Mechanism to Support Sustainable Forest Management related to Thailand REDD+ mechanism at Kaeng Krachan Forest Complex World Heritage Site (Petchaburi Province) and Doi Chiang Dao Biosphere Reserve (Chiangmai Province). There were totally 530 stakeholders (310 persons for Kaeng Krachan and 220 persons for Doi Chiang Dao) participated in this workshop.
 - There were several workshops for project closeout of Thailand R-PP carried out at the regional and central of the country to find out experience exchange, lessons learned, and recommendations generated from the stakeholders. There were totally 489 stakeholders participated in the workshops.

Component 2: REDD+ Strategy Preparation.

Activities under this component support the development of a REDD+ strategy including: supporting analytical work to inform REDD+ strategy development; conducting consultations and studies on key issues related to REDD+, including, identifying drivers and underlying causes of deforestation and forest degradation and respective REDD+ strategy options, forest governance, land tenure, and benefit sharing arrangements; undertaking the SESA and preparing an Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF); reviewing existing Feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanisms (FGRMs), and as necessary, establishing or strengthening the FGRM(s); designing a safeguard monitoring system; and supporting the elaboration of the draft REDD+ strategy.

CS-6 Package: The CS-6 Contract for REDD+ National Strategy was signed on 12 June 2019. The contract period was 1 year with amount of US\$987,030.00 and Baht 6,573,125.00. This package has not been completed as expected. Many of the issues relating to timing and sequencing of the deliverables were far behind schedule. The related reports were unsatisfied. As a result of incorrect and incomplete per TOR, and inability to apply substance of the report to achieve the target date as planned for the formation of the country REDD+ strategy; DNP forwarded notification of decline to accept report submission. Additionally, the contract was expired without improvement of the reports. The Contractor responded with decline to accept DNP's contract termination. DNP received official notification demanding payment for US\$ 735,443.69 USD, and Baht 4,455,277.50, the rest of contract price, for consulting works done failing which the consultant shall precede to the legal action. DNP, upon consultation with the Office of the Attorney General, the World Bank and REDD+ expert regarding consultant contract expiration, has been advised to go through a negotiated settlement, which has proceeded subsequently with joint resolution to compensate the consultant for works already done which has been useful to DNP, with amounting to US\$180,000 for contract termination. The mutual termination agreement between Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation (DNP) and the consulting firm has been prepared and signed by the parties.

CS-6.2 Package: The National REDD+ Strategy and the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment for the REDD+ Mechanism in Thailand, Part II, Contract (CS-6.2) was signed on 10

February 2021; given the contract period of 300 days which ended in 7 December 2021. There were various committees to review all reports and products, namely, the Technical Working Group and the Evaluation Committee. Additionally, DNP hired an external expert to help review all consultants' reports.

A draft of National REDD+ Strategy and the Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment for the REDD+ Mechanism in Thailand was finalized with following supporting documents:

- Task 1. Analysis of land use, land use change drivers, forest law, policy, regulation, forest Institution and governance
- Task 2. Preparation of National REDD+ Strategy
- Task 3. Preparation of Strategic Environmental and Social Assessment (SESA), and Environmental and Social Management Framework (ESMF)
- Task 4. Preparation of Safeguard Information and Monitoring System
- Task 5. Preparation of REDD+ benefit-sharing arrangement
- Task 6. Preparation of Feedback and Grievance Redress Mechanism (GRM)

The process for endorsement of the National Committee on Climate Change Policy will be prepared.

Component 3: Forest Monitoring and Emission.

Activities under this component support the development of a reference emission level ("REL") and monitoring, reporting and verification system ("MRV") , including: supporting the establishment of a REL by, inter alia, reviewing, compiling, analyzing information and developing a national REL estimate; providing technical support to, inter alia, develop models for emissions estimations; supporting the technical design and proposal for enhancing the national forest inventory and monitoring system to support REDD+; compiling, analyzing and disseminating information on the latest national forest inventory; and providing training to government officials and other stakeholders in MRV and software programming. The outcomes under this component included:

- DNP signed agreement with FAO for "Technical Assistance for the Development of REDD+MRV system and Forest Reference Level for Thailand" on 6 September 2018 and the closing date was on 30 September 2020.
- The FREL/FRL report was submitted for review and approval from the following committee:
 - the REDD+ Task Force Committee on 20 October 2020;
 - the Subcommittee on Climate Change Policy and Planning Integration on 26 November 2020.
 - the National Committee on Climate Change Policy (NCCC) at the national level, chaired by the Prime Minister on 4 January 2021.
- Upon approval from sequence committees, the Office of Natural Resources and Environmental Policy and Planning (ONEP), as the National Designated Authority (NDA), submitted the report of forest reference emission levels and forest reference levels (FREL/FRL) on 8 January 2021 to the UNFCCC for the Technical Assessment of 2021.
- The meeting for Technical Assessment (TA) among the Assessment Team (AT) of the UNFCCC, DNP officers and FAO was held during 19-23 April 2021. The DNP revised the FREL/FRL report to meet the comments from the AT sent the "Modified Submission Report" to the UNFCCC on 28 June 2021. The FREL/FRL report of Thailand was approved by the TA 2021 and published accordingly on the UNFCCC website at <https://redd.unfccc.int/submissions.html?country=tha>

Component 4: Project Management, Monitoring, and Evaluation Framework

Activities under this component supported the management and coordination of REDD+ readiness activities, financial and procurement services, as well as monitoring and coordination of the overall operation.

- Monitoring & Evaluation (M&E) system was established and operational supported timely activities and financial reporting. The regular reports were completed and sent to the World Bank in time:
 - Thailand’s Annual Progress Report (for 2017 to 2021).
 - Mid-term Progress Report (MTR).
 - Interim Unaudited Financial Report (IFR) (every 6 months).
 - Designated Account Reconciliation Statement Report (every 3 months)
 - Audited Financial Statement for Fiscal Year 2018 to 2021
- The project’s financial statement reports were audited by the external auditor, and submitted to WB and related agencies, including posting on DNP’s website.
- Overall workplan and procurement plans were developed.
- Financial Management reviewed regularly by the World Bank and external audited.

3. Lessons Learned

The list below synthesizes the factors that have affected the performance of the project. It highlights important best practices and lessons learned.

- **Positive influence/learnt**
 - The achievement for the readiness preparation of REDD+ mechanism in Thailand which to be ready for further implementation to support the global warming mitigation.
 - It is good to learn on the adaptive project management, this could support regular work or other future project operation.
 - The opportunity for staff to improve knowledge and skill through the capacity building; adaptive learning, together with learning by doing. This will support their future work.
 - The project helped enhancing the cooperation and contribution from Government agencies, and the World Bank including interagency collaboration and the role of sectoral development and sharing.
 - Important stakeholder engagement and networking were recognized.
 - The key project output will support national related responsibilities and be embedded (e.g. SIS, FGRM) in existing national systems
- **Negative influence/learnt**
 - There was unstaffed of the implementing unit, this brought to overload for project staff.
 - There was rotation of officials for project responsible this made discontinuity in the project operation.
 - There were times constraint to learn and implement, the project had to follow the government’s law and simultaneously WB’s regulation, for each activity.
 - There were some delays due to officials’ reasons (e.g., government system and act; forest act, sustainable land use policy).
 - The effects from the pandemic of the COVID 19 on the project implementation particularly the meeting for consultation.

4. Project Cost by Readiness Grant Activity

Activities	Amount at Approval	Actual at Project	Percentage of
------------	--------------------	-------------------	---------------

	(US\$)	Closing (US\$)	Approval (%)
Component 1	1,131,500.00	805,895.37	71.22
Component 2	897,000.00	852,238.62	95.01
Component 3	825,000.00	825,000.00	100.00
Component 4	746,500.00	292,884.26	39.23
TOTAL	3,600,000.00	2,776,018.25	77.11