# CONSULTATIONS WITH BATWA ON REDUCING EMISSION THROUGH DEFORESTATION AND DEGRADATION (REDD+) Muko, Kabale and Kasitu, Bundibugyo DISTRICT 21st - 24th August 2010



Batwa men and women participants at the REDD+ consultative meeting at Muko Sub county, Kabale District



Nkaita the only literate Mutwa in Bundibugyo writes down the issues discussed by the men's group

King Nzito the leader of the Bundibugyo raises his arm to contribute to the discussion



## **Table of Contents**

List of Acronyms	3
1.0 Introduction	
2.0 Background to the REDD+ consultative process:	4
2.1 Background to the Batwa Consultative meetings	
2.2 Objectives of the consultative meetings	5
3.0 Methodology employed	
3.1 Official Opening:	6
3.2 Remarks from the South western Range Manager	
3.3 Presentation of the key issues from the previous sensitizations meeting	gs
4.0 Out comes of the Benefits and Risks analysis	
4.1 Benefits Analysis by the Bundibugyo and Kabale Batwa Participants:	
4.2 Risks Analysis by the Bundibugyo and Kabale Batwa Participants: 10	
5.0 Synthesis of the outcomes and Recommendation: 11	
6. Conclusion	2
Annex (i): Participants at REDD+ Consultative meeting on 21st September	
2010 at the Muko sub county, Kabale	
Attendance list for Participants at REDD+ Consultative meeting on 23rd Sep	•
2010 at Kasitu Sub county Bundibugyo14	4

## List of Acronyms

ACDO Assistant Community Development Officer

BMCT Bwindi Mgahinga Conservation Trust

CARE Cooperative for Assistance and Relief Everywhere, Inc.

CFM Collaborative Forest Management

CFR Central Forest Reserve
CSO Civil Society Organization
DLG District Local Government
EHO Environmental Health Officer
FCPF Forest Carbon Partnership Facility

FPP Forest Peoples Programme
GHG Green House Gas Emissions

IPCC Inter Governmental Panel on Climate Change

MRGI Minority Rights Group International NAADS National Agricultural Advisory Services

NFA National Forest Authority
PRA Participatory Rural Appraisal

REDD Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest

Degradation

R-PP REDD+ Readiness Plan Proposal

REPA Rights, Equity and Protected Areas Programme of CARE

Uganda

UBC TV Uganda Broadcasting Corporation Television

ULA Uganda Land Alliance

UNFCCC United Nations Framework Convention of Climate Change UOBDU United Organization for Batwa Development in Uganda

UWA Uganda Wildlife Authority

#### 1.0 Introduction

This report is an output of the consultative process with the indigenous Batwa communities in the western and south western Uganda in regard to the preparation of the REDD+ readiness proposal for Uganda. These consultations were held at sub county level. The two sub counties involved were Kasitu in Bundibugyo and Muko in Kabale. The report is presented in such a way to enable the reader follow the process through which the consultative meetings were conducted. Deliberate efforts have been made to clarify the methodology employed right from the sensitization meetings through the actual consultations. The report focuses on the analysis made by the Batwa in regard to the likely implications of the REDD+ on their livelihoods, rights and entitlements. The last section of the report captures a set of recommendations to the REDD+ working group.

## 2.0 Background to the REDD+ consultative process:

Uganda is one of the 37 countries participating in the REDD+ initiative for developing countries funded by World Bank's Forest Carbon Partnership Facility (FCPF). The national focal office is hosted by NFA, the lead agency with the mandate to over see the management and maintenance of the gazzetted forest estate in Uganda. The REDD+ process is phased. The initial process is a preparatory phase, followed by a planning phase and later and implementation phase. Since September 2009, Uganda has been working on the start up activities for the preparatory phase that would lead to the development of a good REDD+ readiness proposal (R-PP) for the country. The R-PP if approved will result into the development of the national REDD-readiness strategy/ plan to be implemented in future.

The development of the R-PP is a highly consultative process that calls for the involvement of all stakeholders. The guidelines further emphasize the need for deliberate efforts to get views from the indigenous people and other vulnerable and marginalized groups and forest communities. As part of ensuring participation of all key stakeholders, a series of regional consultative workshops were convened by the REDD+ secretariat with support from members of the working groups drawn from various government agencies and the civil society. The diverse disposition of the stakeholders, with regard to literacy levels, exposure and confidence levels reduced opportunities for effective participation of all participants. Therefore the environment where the regional consultation were held, coupled with the methodologies employed did not provide for effective engagement and participation of the vulnerable groups. A review of the consultative process observed that indigenous people and communities around the forest reserves and national parks had not been adequately consulted.

As part of filling the identified gaps, CARE Uganda through the Rights Equity Protected Areas (REPA) programme, with financial support from the REDD+ secretariat facilitated the consultative meetings for the Batwa in Kabale and Bundibugyo districts. This was premised on the fact that REPA has resident capacity to undertake the task with on going interventions in the west and south western Uganda, and the experience of working with Batwa and other forest communities.

## 2.1 Background to the Batwa Consultative meetings

The Batwa consultative meetings were preceded by a series of sensitization meetings on REDD+ facilitated by the CARE field staff. These meetings were intended to build a common understanding of REDD+ concepts and clarify on going REDD+ processes among the Batwa. During the sensitization meetings, CARE used PRA tools to build consensus with the Batwa before introducing them to the key on REDD+ concept. It's worthy mentioning that as part of mobilization, the team worked with fair representation of both Batwa men and women. In this regard 63 individuals participated in the consultative meetings. 25 were females and 38 males. The local leaders within the areas where the Batwa live were very helpful during the sensitizations. Whereas the sensitization meetings were open to all Batwa within the locality, on the other hand the consultative meetings had restricted participation. Each Batwa settlement selected representatives that deliberated on the REDD+ issues at the sub county level to generate proposals that are contained in this report.

## 2.2 Objectives of the consultative meetings

- Sensitize and increase awareness about the national REDD+ process among the Batwa.
- Increase the Batwa communities understanding of their relationship with the forest and generate ideas that can improve the maintenance of the forests without compromising their livelihood support mechanisms.
- Create a plat form through which the Batwa men and women could meaning fully be engaged to reflect on the REDD+ process and propose recommendations to inform the design of the RPP.
- Document out comes of the consultative workshops so that the key lessons are used to inform the REDD proposal.

## 3.0 Methodology employed

The consultative meetings were coordinated by CARE field



staff in collaboration with local leaders of the areas within which the Batwa people live. The lead agencies such as UWA – Semliki National park, Bwindi and Mghahinga conservation area and NFA Southwestern systems range and the sub county Local governments were involved.

Moderation of the consultations was guided by CARE using tools developed by the team. Among the tools employed were the PRA tools for resource needs analysis and pair wise ranking for prioritization during the sensitization meetings. The intention was to ensure that the Batwa link their livelihood to other development processes, otherwise if not reflected on would affect them. Also the process intended to support the Batwa have a broader perspective in view of the impacts of climate change and REDD+ on the wider community. In order to carry out a comprehensive analysis of REDD+, a Benefits and Risk Analysis (BRA) tool was used.

The question and answer technique was used to enhance the recall memory for purposes of ensuring that the participants link the meetings at the sub counties with the ones held in their settlements. In addition, each community was able to do a quick recap of the key issues discussed at the sensitization to ensure that all participants were at the same level. The facilitators ensured that both men and women contributed to the discussion so as to capture the different perspectives to the issues.

## 3.1 Official Opening:

The chairpersons LC III for Muko and Kasitu sub counties were given the opportunity to welcome participants to the consultative meetings. This was for purpose of securing legitimacy of the local government leadership about the REDD+ Consultations. The two leaders observed that the REDD+ process was unique because it had specifically sought the views of Batwa who were often not consulted in the design of government programmes.

## 3.2 Remarks from the South western Range Manager

Mr. Twinomuhangi Leo explained to the participants the importance of their contribution to the REDD+ process. He gave the history of REDD+ processes and used Batwa's experiences to explain the concept of climate change. He linked the need to address effects of climate change to the REDD+. He explained REDD+ as a financing mechanism through which the World Bank intends to promote conservation of existing tracts of indigenous forests to maintain the carbon stocks. In addition the financing mechanism would support establishment of new forest plantations with indigenous trees. This would then increase the carbon stocks responsible for absorbing gases that cause the negative effects when realized to the atmosphere leading to climate change.

## 3.3 Presentation of the key issues from the previous sensitizations meetings

Whereas the facilitators had summarized the key issues from the sensitization meetings, the participants were guided in a brain storming session to review the previous process. This was intended to ensure that the priority issues are generated by the Batwa them selves. With the priorities validated, the facilitators introduced the BRA tool and the priority issues were integrated as the parameters to be used during the analysis.



Men's group discussing REDD+ issues

separated to ensure that there is active participation of both sexes. Initially the participants reflected on the likely benefits that likely to accrue from the implementation of the REDD + based on each of the five parameters i.e. Basic needs. incomes, production systems, rights and governance. This was followed by groups identifying the potential risks of REDD+ initiative the

proposals to improve the RPP design were discussed. Different views were harmonized during the plenary where each group had an opportunity to present.



The Batwa women during the group work at Kasitu sub county, Bundibugyo

Generally, there was little variation between the issues raised by the men and women. Also issues raised in the Batwa in Bundibugyo were close related to the Kabale outcomes as illustrated in the table below.

## 4.0 Out comes of the Benefits and Risks analysis

## 4.1 Benefits Analysis by the Bundibugyo and Kabale Batwa Participants:

Parameters	Bundibugyo	Kabale		
Basic needs	Batwa feel their immediate needs are food, land, shelter, medical care, fuel wood, clean water, clothing, beddings and household utensils.  They anticipated that government through REDD+ would;	The financial benefits from REDD+ (carbon credits would contribute to addressing basic needs of Batw such as:  • land and shelter (for landless Batwa), firewood hoes, pangas (machetes), soap, salt, paraffi		
	Put in place a mechanism that supports them to access health services with out being discriminated against.	clothing, food, saucepans, plates, health services, education, beddings and clean water and good sanitation.		
	<ul> <li>Make deliberate efforts to secure for them land where they can grow their crops and hence become food secure.</li> </ul>	Batwa thought that the existing collaborative forest management with NFA would strengthen further Batwa's capacity to engage with duty-bearers through effective and inclusive policies.		
	<ul> <li>Provide land with decent shelter, clothing and a habitable environment that will encourage the children to go to school.</li> </ul>	This would then ensure more sustainable access to handicrafts material; especially bamboo and ropes and medicinal herbs.		
Incomes	<ul> <li>Government would make deliberate efforts to target them through vocation skills enhancement .e.g production of high quality crafts that would be sold at a higher price.</li> </ul>	Batwa proposed that financial benefits from REDD+ (carbon credits) be applied to community level income generating projects.		
	<ul> <li>REDD+ would provide mechanisms of sharing incomes from the protected areas with the forest people given their ancestral ties.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The support will take the form of agricultural inputs and implements and advisory services. The following projects were prioritized: sheep rearing, bee-keeping, goats, chicken, pigs, small ruminants (like rabbits), handcrafts, mushrooms</li> </ul>		
	<ul> <li>That government would introduce alternatives to the resource they currently extract from the protected area in form of income generating projects like bee keeping, poultry, goats and improved crops.</li> </ul>	and passion fruit growing, Irish potato and vegetable management.		

Production systems	<ul> <li>The inability to own their own land was raised as the main cause of their current situation that has made them dependant on forests for their livelihood.</li> <li>The men felt that REDD+ presented opportunities for them to continue accessing resources from the protected areas through formal agreements in a regulated manner, however their would be stronger compliance measures.</li> <li>The women on the other hand felt that through REDD+ they would be supported to secure their own pieces of land. On this they would engage in agro forestry as an alternative to obtaining poles and fuel wood from the protected area. Also they would be in position to produce their own food and stop selling cheap labour.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Batwa identified landlessness as the most critical production constraint.</li> <li>They proposed that part of the REDD+ proceeds would be allocated to procurement of land. Land acquisition and security of tenure was identified as the major avenue for increasing productivity and safeguarding their livelihoods.</li> <li>Batwa also mentioned that since soil fertility in Kabale region had declined, REDD+ would be an opportunity to invest in improved soil fertility management and agro-forestry systems which would enhance water and soil conservation.</li> </ul>
Rights	<ul> <li>Their right to participate would be granted and they would contribute to the development process.</li> <li>Therefore, government would take affirmative actions to ensure that the Batwa are represented right from LC. I as well as being included in different consultations by government.</li> <li>Government would recognize their customary sites and provide mechanisms for continued access to these sites under an agreed procedure.</li> </ul>	They felt that their level of awareness and understanding of the issues around them had significantly improved. They were in a better position to articulate their interests after several capacity building initiatives supported by various organizations such as FPP, CARE, ULA and MRGI.  Their collaborative forest management user rights. Batwa were of the view that with support from the CSOs, for the first time in their history; they would have an advantage in advocating for more legal recognition as part of the process to define the REDD+ benefit sharing modalities.
Governance	The Batwa women argued that REDD+ was likely to result into their being recognized and hence would be represented on decision making structures in future. Since they had been involved in the consultations any way.	They felt that compliance with the carbon crediting and payment flow would lead to more transparent arrangements, Batwa were of the view that this would compel the governance institutions to become more transparent. This would increase chances for Batwa to benefit from REDD+ revenues.

## 4.2 Risks Analysis by the Bundibugyo and Kabale Batwa Participants:

Parameters	Bundibugyo	Kabale
Basic needs	<ul> <li>Loss of access to resources from the protected area, particularly the herbal medicines, fuel wood and poles. Yet their livelihood is entirely dependent on these resources national park / forest resources.</li> <li>Increased food insecurity due to loss of access to resources that are currently supporting their livelihoods.</li> </ul>	Batwa said that in case the local rights and forest use are ignored, there would be reduced access to non-timber forest products as already such as craft materials, herbal medicines, wild honey, e.t.c.
Incomes	Loss of income sources since all their incomes is currently being raised from the sell of resources they collect from the protected area to the wider community.	Employment opportunities would be lost especially, timber-cutting and furniture making. In case REDD+ benefits were not evenly distributed, there would be inequity whereby some members of the community especially non-Batwa would benefit more at the expense of the most deserving landless Batwa.
Production systems	<ul> <li>There would be restricted access to the park resource or completely stoppage to pick any thing from the forest.</li> </ul>	The major risk associated with the production system was lack of tenure security. Another risk was that ill-advised shifts to agro-forestry and reforestation programmes could lead to environmental degradation which would affect agricultural production negatively.
Rights	<ul> <li>There could be denial to freedom of speech on issues of the forest and their ancestral rights.</li> <li>Loss of access to the historical sites yet they still have strong attachments to them.</li> </ul>	Without adequate support from CSOs, powerful government or private interests would marginalize the rights of Batwa after the value of the forests has increased upon the introduction of REDD+
Governance	<ul> <li>Total negligence by government resulting in deeper poverty and probably extinction.</li> <li>Further marginalization and exploitation by the government and the dominant communities in which the Batwa live.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Batwa expressed a fear about corruption whereby as more and more REDD funds flow into national and local governments increasing temptation for corruption.</li> <li>Batwa also identified a potential conflict between leaders as more funds flow to especially the Local Government level.</li> </ul>

#### 5.0 Synthesis of the outcomes and Recommendation:

From the tables above it can be observed that the two Batwa communities are living in same context though at different levels of development and exposure hence the slight difference in their challenges. The Bundibugyo Batwa are still heavily dependent on the forests resources with no alternatives except the sale of cheap manual labour. Currently they do not have interface with civil society organization support. On the other hand, the Batwa in Kabale have reduced their dependence on the forest resources, they are venturing into other livelihood options such as agriculture which comes out strongly in their analysis. Their level of confidence and awareness is high in respect to their perceptions on governance and the rights issues among others. However, what is important is that both groups are able to observe that with a well governed REDD+ process and programme, there is a possibility of enhancing forestry management as well as addressing the historical injustices that have affected them for along time.

The following recommendations were made;

### Develop arrangements to channel benefits directly to Batwa

Batwa were aware of a mechanism through which REDD+ benefits could be delivered from the national level (reference was made to tourism revenue sharing). However, they proposed a parallel system whereby REDD+ benefits could directly flow to the community level. Batwa think that the benefits from national level had been going through a very bureaucratic process and do not effectively respond to their unique needs. They proposed that setting up a special fund targeted at the Batwa them selves would increase the benefits directly within their communities.

## 2. Strengthen Collaborative resource access and Forest management arrangements

Across the groups, currently, the main resource access mechanism is collaborative arrangements either under CFM or co-management with NFA and UWA respectively. They proposed that REDD+ revenues be invested in strengthening CFM user groups through skills development for production of high quality craft products, bee keeping, and confidence building initiatives for the adult Batwa so as to benefit more from REDD+.

## 3 Design REDD+ scheme to strengthen governance

Batwa suggested the need to support reforms in the governance sector to create an enabling institutional framework to protect their rights, secure land tenure and land rights. Since CFM was identified as one of the best entry points to REDD+; Batwa proposed that there was a need for them to become directly represented on CFM user groups' governance structures and other community leadership structures.

## 4. Promote synergies between different government departments

Batwa enumerated various factors that have kept them poor. The key issues being landlessness, they argued that REDD+ needed to invest in processes that will lead their resettlement. They proposed the provision of decent home steads that encourage the Batwa parents and motivate their children to go to school. In addition, REDD+ through NFA would engage with the other sectors of service delivery to promote synergy between different government departments and ensure they too have improved access to service delivery (lack of medical care, agricultural advisory services and education).

# 5. Ensure that Batwa's carbon rights are established in national and local Governments' regulations

Batwa questioned the rights over the proceeds from the carbon credits given that they were there before the protected area (government). Whereas it was clarified that government had the rights over the gazzetted forest and national parks, they argued government to clearly define rights issues surrounding the carbon credits. They proposed that before implementation of the REDD+, carbon rights should be well defined in national regulations and that all stakeholders sensitized about them. This they said would mitigate cases of powerful and well positioned individuals and institution grabbing what does not belong to them.

#### 6. Conclusion

From the proposals raised by the indigenous issues, it can be concluded that the Batwa as a people clearly know what is best for them and what government needs to do if REDD+ should benefit them. We hope that these recommendations will inform the R-PP. The CARE team would like to take this opportunity to thank the REDD+ secretariat for taking a bold step in ensuring that the voices of the voiceless are heard. It was an enriching process and a cause worthy undertaking given the importance of this process for the forest dependant communities.

Annex (i): Participants at REDD+ Consultative meeting on 21st September 2010 at the Muko sub county, Kabale

No.		Sex			
	Name	М	F	Organization	Title
01	Habyarimana John Bosco	Χ		UOBDU	Field Assistant
02	Ntezikyi Kedress		Χ	Rwamahano settlement	Batwa Representative
03	Tumuhimbise Fiona		Χ	Karengyere settlement	Batwa Representative
04	Twikirize Allen		Χ	Rwamahano Settlement	Batwa Representative
05	Kyabazaaga Nora		Χ	Rwamahano settlement	Batwa Representative
06	Neza Henry	Χ		UOBDU	Capacity Building Officer
07	Kirasi Simon	Χ		NFA – Echuya CFR	Forest Supervisor
80	Tumusiime Stephen	Χ		BMCT	Community Projects Officer
09	Biraaro Yohana	Χ		Rwamahano Settlement	Batwa Representative
10	Tumurinde Zakaria	Χ		Rwamahano Settlement	Batwa Representative
11	Kanusu John	Χ		Rwamahano Settlement	Batwa Representative
12	Turyamureeba Christopher	Χ		Muko S/C LG	Sub-Accountant
13	Bagazonzya Franco	Χ		Muko S/C LG	Assistant Agriculture Officer and NAADS
					Coordinator
14	Mugabe Robert	Χ		UOBDU	Driver
15	Masiko Jackson	Χ		Muko S/C	ACDO
16	Gumisiriza Michael	Χ		NFA	TA
17	Boonabaana Angela		Χ	NFA	Accounts and Administration
18	Tumwineyo Denis	Х		Ikamiro Parish, Muko Sub- County	Parish Chief
19	Bisasire Samson	Χ		Karengyere Community	Batwa Representative
20	Bashekwire Hope		Χ	Rwamahano Community	Batwa Representative
21	Bataryahoma Oliva		Х	Ryamihanda Batwa Community	Batwa Representative
22	Burooro Yakobo	Χ		Karengyere Community	Batwa Representative
23	Basiima Joseph	Χ		Karengyere Community	Batwa Representative
24	Pathias Karekona	Χ		UBC TV and Uganda Media	Programme Producer
			1	Trust for Environment	
25	Tumwesigye Alex	Χ		NFA	Sector Manager
26	Mugisha N Bikangiso		Χ	Muko S/C LG	Sub-County Chief
28	Manzi Gordon	Χ		Muko S/CLG	Community Development Officer

No.		Sex			
	Name	M	F	Organization	Title
29	Leo Twinomuhangi	Χ		NFA	Range Manager, South Western Uganda
30	Besigye Samuel	Χ		CARE-REPA	Field Coordinator
	TOTAL	21	80		

# Attendance list for Participants at REDD+ Consultative meeting on 23<sup>rd</sup> Sept, 2010 at Kasitu Sub county Bundibugyo

No.	Name	M	F		Village/Location
01	Grace Mgbatina		Х	Vice chairperson for the Batwa	Bundimasoli
02	Kainta Wilson	Χ			Каререре
03	Nkabana		Χ		Bundimasoli
04	Nzito Geoffrey	Χ		Leader for the Batwa King	Bundimasoli
05	Jomina Masika		Χ		Bundimasoli
06	Balyebulya Julius	Χ			Bundimasoli
07	Bendera Stephen	Χ			Bundimasoli
08	Bagweziba .J	Χ			Bundimasoli
09	Rafeli	Χ			Bundimasoli
10	Bamberezi Annet		Χ		Bundimasoli
11	Kabanaku Safurise		Χ		Bundimasoli
12	Kahombi B.		Χ		Каререре
13	Masika Miriya		Χ		Bundimasoli
14	Dingolo Edireda	Χ			Bundimasoli
15	Batiye Yosefina		Χ		Bundimasoli
16	Bunjeri Rose		Χ		Bundimasoli
17	Asiimwe Oliver		Χ		Каререре
18	Yolamu Akumanya	Χ			Bundimasoli
19	Mugisa Ezekiel	Χ		LC I chairperson	Bundimasoli
20	Tabita Janet		Χ		Bundimasoli
21	Nakyanzi Grace		Х		Bundimasoli
22	Frasini Amooti	Χ			Bundimasoli
23	Katusabe Night		Х		Bundimasoli
24	Asule Jackson	Χ			Bundimasoli

25	Kamalha	Χ		Chairperson LC III -Kasitu	Kasitu S/C HQ
26	Guma Kandole Nicholas	Χ		Sub county Chief	Kasitu S/C HQ
27		Χ		CCR – Semliki National Park	Ntandi
28	Mpiigwa Winnie		Χ	EHO-Kasitu sub county	Kasitu s/c
28	Abel Judith		Χ	Sector -Manager NFA - Bushenyi	Kashohya Kitomi
29	Boonabaana Angela		Χ	Accountant -NFA Bushenyi	Bushenyi
30	Twinomuhangi Leo	Χ		Range Manager	Bushenyi
31	Pathias Kareekona	Χ		Programme producer.	UBCTV and Uganda Media Trust for
					Environment
32	Alinda Violet		Χ	Coordinator -CARE	Fortportal
	Totals	17	17		