

The REDD Technical Working Group (RTWG) and the REDD Secretariat of the readiness program of Ethiopia would like to thank the FCPF Technical Advisory Panel (TAP) and the FCPF Technical Team for providing us very concrete, well researched and above all constructive comments and suggestions on the R-PP Ethiopia.

The following is the summary report of the RTWG on TAP synthesis review

Component 1

Component 1a

- **Regarding the observation and recommendation on the Role of MoARD on REDD+ implementation (Page 12),** the reviewer's comments are well taken by the RTWG. The EPA will continue to work as a regulatory body not as an implementing body. In this respect, the RTWG supports the establishment of a dedicated and stand alone forestry institution that will manage and administer the forest resources and implement all activities of REDD+. The decision to establish such institution will be decided by higher policy makers. Therefore, this will be facilitated by EPA and presented to National Environmental Council, which is chaired by the PM. Since Ethiopia is following a Federal government structure, the envisaged forestry institution will be working on enhancing the capacity of and empowering the regional forest managers in managing the forests and implementation of REDD+. Therefore this idea is captured in the R-PP document (Component 1a) as follows:

"....The views expressed by the consultations of stakeholders, which included representatives of the MoARD is that the focus of MoARD is agriculture and FEPA should continue to chair the REDD readiness process until a dedicated federal body is created for forestry; if and when the Federal government sees the need to create such a dedicated federal forestry agency. The problem is encountered in the regions as well, with Oromia and Amhara being the exceptions in having their own respective forestry enterprises."

- **Regarding representation of a REDD Technical Working Group (Page 12),** the comment is valid and well taken. Therefore the RTWG will consist of both national and regional representatives. In this proposed arrangement, RSC will be chaired by EPA and on ad hoc basis EPA will serve as a secretariat for RSC (REDD Secretariat). On the other hand, a member not drawn from the EPA will be the chair of the RTWG. On this regard the following statement is added on the R-PP:

"...For this reason, the EPA's intention is that, when this RTWG has gained experience and knowledge on REDD+ issues, it could be chaired by a member not drawn from the EPA."

- On the need for similar REDD institutions at regional level (Page 12,13&14), the following is added:

“....The trained human capacity is low in the whole of Ethiopia, but it is comparatively better in the four high regions (Southern, Oromia, Amhara and Tigray). As soon as the regional trained human capacity allows, consultations will include all the regions and the membership of the RTWG will become truly representative. All the regions are being helped to acquire the needed expertise.”

“....It should be emphasized that there will be very little, if at all, overlap in the membership of this hierarchical working groups and thus, far from adding complexity, these working groups at the different administrative levels will become more accessible at the respective level than would have been the case if there were only countrywide working group only.”

....This National REDD Secretariat will liaise with each regional administration level environmental protection office¹ which will become the REDD Secretariat for its administrative region. If seen as needed during the implementation of the R-PP, each region environmental protection office will be represented by a REDD Officer in each respective Woreda Administration.”

- **Members of the RSC including an umbrella organization of NGOs** [Forum for Environment (FfE)] are already shown in table 1(Page 15); the main text is revised accordingly.
- **The issue of regional representation** is addressed by inclusion of Regional Environmental Agencies in the RSC [see table 1]
- **The issue of inclusion for a parliamentarian in the RSC** is already addressed [see table 1]

Component 1b

- Regarding the next steps of consultation processes before presentation of the R-PP and on main insights gathered from the consultations done so far (Page 23&24), the following are added:

¹ All the National Regional States have established or designated their own respective environmental protection organs.

"...Further awareness raising activities on REDD+ and triangulation of findings to date through further consultations at regional and community level will take place before R-PP presentation to triangulate findings and build broader ownership over the R-PP. However it must be noted that consultations will continue throughout R-PP implementation and it is expected that as awareness is raised and expectations become more realistic for REDD+ that there will be less bias in some of the findings."

"Participatory methods build ownership. It was noted during the consultation workshops that the extensive use of participatory methods built ownership over both the process and the outcome, this R-PP. These methods will continually be improved to keep the momentum going so that ownership over the R-PP and its implementation grows."

- **On categories of Forest Stakeholders (Table5, Page 28)**, a row for "Private forestry sector-non wood enterprises (small scale and large scale) is added together with their corresponding current involvement or their current stake and the future strategy of involvement in the REDD+ process.

Component 2

Component 2a

- The concern raised by the TAP on wood energy as a driver of deforestation and forest degradation and is addressed in the document on Figure 10 (Page 49) and by the following statements (Page 50):

"...Even firewood was traditionally derived from dried up twigs and the occasionally dying trees. With population growth and especially with urbanization, more and more trees are felled for fuel wood. Even thus, most of the firewood still comes from eucalyptus plantations and not from native forest species. Ethiopia's energy consumption is predominately based on biomass energy sources (94%) [*Energy Policy of Ethiopia, 2006*]. This includes traditional Energy sources such as fuel wood, charcoal, branches, leaves and twigs. This has caused severe deforestation and environmental degradation. Hence, lead to increased vulnerability to the adverse impacts of climate change."

- **On lack of law enforcement (Page 51):**

"Absence of a dedicated institution coupled with inadequate regulatory infrastructure is the primary causes for lack of implementation and enforcement of the particulars articulated or regulated under the policy and the proclamation issued in relation to forest management in Ethiopia. Therefore, in order to enhance the implementation of and compliance with the relevant policies and laws issued in the area of forestry requires designation of

inspectors or monitors and enactment of regulations, standards, directives and guidelines to concretely define and elaborate the existing relevant public documents”

- **On lack of benefit sharing mechanism (Page 51):**

“The Environmental Policy of Ethiopia has stated “To ensure that park, forest and wildlife conservation and management programmes which conserve biological diversity on behalf of the country allow for a major part of any economic benefits deriving there from to be channelled to local communities affected by such programmes”. There is also a law that supports benefit sharing mechanism in connection to forest management (the Federal Forest Development, Conservation and Utilization Proclamation No. 542/2007, Article 10, sub-article 3). However, the said Policy and Proclamation cannot implement themselves. Their implementation requires the preparation and approval of subsidiary public documents; such as, standards, directives or guidelines whichever is appropriate.”

Component 2b

Critical reviews of past and current strategies to address D & D (see page 58 - 63) the following is added:

“.....Current strategies aimed at addressing deforestation and degradation in Ethiopia within the current legal and policy framework can be divided into.... the list of strategies are adjusted as follows (Page 58):

- (1) Plantation forest of exotic species,
- (2) Agroforestry,
- (3) Area closures of deforested areas for natural forest regeneration,
- (4) Protected areas of natural forest, National Parks
- (5) CDM project areas related to plantations/reforestations,
- (6) Devolution of forest management through participatory forest management (PFM),
- (7) Traditional/customary forest management practices,
- (8) REDD+ pilots
- (9) National Bio fuel Strategy: national biogas program, rural electrification [renewable energy], dissemination of fuel efficient improved stoves

(10) Food Security Strategy

(11) Integration of REDD+ into budget, laws, policy, strategy, program, plan and projects

On Area Closures (Page 60, Area Enclosures is changed into Area Closure)

“....In northern Ethiopia, area closures and cutting and carrying fodder are usually integrated. The resulting increase in animal dropping by the homestead is used for making compost as soil conditioner. This raises agricultural production and makes the area closure attractive. The required coordination is brought about by the whole community in a micro-catchment being organized to function under its own elected leadership which enforces agreed bylaws. In hitherto deforested areas, especially in Northern Ethiopia, area closure with enrichment planting has enabled much land that had lost its forests cover to reforest. Cutting and carrying grass and loping fodder tree branches have made it possible to restrict and often altogether stop free range grazing. The animals become better fed and their droppings are used for making compost as fertilizers. In this way, the forest cover, agricultural production and animal husbandry have improved, thus also improving the economic situation of the mixed farmers.”

On Protected Areas (Page 60)

“Government-controlled forest conservation initiatives began in Ethiopia in the mid 1970s. These initiatives have resulted in the establishment of different types of protected areas such as state-owned Forest Priority Areas (FPAs), National Parks, Game Reserves, Sanctuaries and Controlled Hunting Areas.....”

On Traditional Forest Management Systems (Page 62)

“Places of worship, especially churches and graveyards, have groves around them. Some of these are forests up to tens of hectares in size. Religious reverence keeps these groves and forests protected and they dot the landscape. They are valuable because they serve as sources of seed dispersal for native forests to regenerate in area closures.....”

On REDD+ Pilot Projects (Page 62)

“.....But the most extensive are the local community bylaw based area closures of northern Ethiopia.”

Strategy 9) National Bio-fuel Strategy (addition): National Biogas Program, Rural Electrification (renewable energy), dissemination of fuel efficient improved stoves (Page 62)

“Ethiopia is embarking on an ambitious energy program including electric dams, plantations for bio-fuel development, wind energy, solar energy and other sustainable renewable energy sources. This will lead to shift from wood energy and other similar fossil fuel energy sources to environmentally friendly renewable energy sources. Therefore, REDD+ would play in capitalizing this positive efforts in fighting and addressing climate change issues at national and international arenas. Such shifts in energy sources will reduce deforestation and use of crop residues and cow dung for fuel. In addition to that, it should be noted that bio-fuel plantation will not compete for arable and forest lands.”

Strategy 10) Food Security Strategy

“The negative impact of recurrent drought on human lives in Ethiopia has very much aggravated by D and D. in this regard, the GoE in its Growth and Transformation Plan has developed a strategy by which several million people who are prone to chronic poverty will be self sufficient in food security within the coming five years time from now. One of the various programs that would address food security is to enhance tree planting that would help the poor that would develop economic assets and environmental resilience.”

Strategy 11) On Integration of REDD+ into budget, laws, policy, strategy, program, plan and projects

“The importance of undertaking environmental assessment at strategic and project level is recognized under the laws of Ethiopia. The need to undertake risk assessment prior to the release of genetically modified organisms is also regulated in order to ensure ecosystem and human health. However, their implementation and thus their effectiveness are limited. Despite this fact, the application of strategic assessment enables to integrate concerns of REDD+ into national budget; and into socio-economic development policies, strategies, plans and programs. The application of environmental assessment at a project level also enables to evaluate adverse impacts and integrate appropriate response measures into the life cycle of major public or private investment projects on forestry ecosystems prior to their implementation. Therefore, identifying limitations of existing environmental assessment regulatory system and taking the necessary corrective measures for enhanced integration of REDD+ at all levels will help to contain the adverse impacts likely to result on forest ecosystem in a proactive manner.”

On Solution Analysis for D&D (Page 63 - 65), the following is added:

Adjustment has been done on Figure 12 (Page 63) demonstrating the link with drivers of D&D on component 2a.

The following additional solutions were added (suggested) as response to the problem of D&D.... (Page 64)

Continue with per urban and rural homestead plantations for firewood

“Most towns and rural homesteads have plantations for firewood, mostly Eucalyptus spp. The economic returns from such plantations are reward enough and that is why virtually the whole country is now dotted with them. Traditionally, it is children that have collected dead branches from forests and woodlands for firewood. Now that more than 90% of them attend school, there is an inbuilt motivation to continue planting trees in periurban areas and by rural homesteads for firewood.”

Integrate animal feed and fertilizer production into reforestation

“In Ethiopia, the oxen drawn plough requires agriculture to become mixed for crop and animal production. Therefore, when area closure regenerates forests, it can be made to increase animal feed for cutting and carrying. The domestic animals in restricted areas produce their droppings, and thus compost can easily be made to increase agricultural production. This becomes an inbuilt motive for organized local community to protect area closures and increase forest cover.”

On the Action Plan (Page 67-73, Table 11), the following change has been done:

- The word “Option” is deleted on “Strategy Option a g”.
- Adjustment has been done on the 2nd, 3rd, 7th, 9th, 10th rows

Similar corresponding adjustment has been done on the budget table (Table 12, Page 74)

Component 2c

Reviewers Observations

1. Despite the inclusion of parliamentary representation in the REDD Steering Committee, this framework does not seem to recognize enough, the need to bring in broad sectoral support at a high enough political level.
2. Table 15, Action B.2, seems to miss the point. It is not just cash flow that needs to be managed; a whole accountable, transparent financial

management system has to be established, that people both within and outside Ethiopia will trust.

Responses by the REDD Technical Working Group

- 1) It is true that Parliamentary representation is reflected in the REDD Steering Committee. The Technical Working Group also firmly believes that there should be sectoral support at a high political level. This is the main reason that the Environmental Council is put at the apex of the intended structure. This council is high enough that it is established by a law (Proclamation No. 295/ 2002) issued by the House of Peoples Representatives. To show its high political significance, the Council is chaired by the Prime Minister. In order to ensure sectoral representation, the Council is composed of all line Ministries, including the MoARD, MoME, MoTI, MoWRs. And most importantly, all the presidents of the national regional states are members of this Council. Confederation of Trade Unions, the private sector (through the Ethiopian Chamber of Commerce) as well as representatives of civil society organizations are made members of the Council - making it even more comprehensive in its policy adoption mandate on Environmental issues in Ethiopia. Therefore the Technical Working Group is of a strong stand that, given the current environment governance, the Environmental Council is a setup that has a broad sectoral support at a highest political level.

As it is outlined under the Proclamation that established the Environmental Council (i.e. Proclamation No. 295/ 2002), it is the Federal Environmental Protection Authority (EPA) that serves as its Secretary. All draft environmental policy documents (such as the R-PP under consideration) intended for deliberation by the council, should be tabled by this Secretary. Given the above reasoning, it is therefore logical to make EPA the chair for the RSC.

Regarding the issue of REDD secretariatship; the REDD Technical Working Group has envisaged the following.

- The Secretariatship should be maintained and continued EPA as its secretary (provisionally). As EPA is the Chair of the RSC, it would be expedient that its secretarial services be handled by itself. This would continue on an ad-hoc basis.
- When the proposal for the establishment of a standalone forestry institution in Ethiopia is duly accepted and such an institution is established, it will assume the role of a Secretariat for the RSC.

Regarding the chairmanship of the RTWG, the TAP has appropriately pointed the likely conflict of interest by the assumption of dual role by EPA (by being chair of both the RSC and the RTWG). The REDD Technical Working Group has unanimously accepted the comment. It has analyzed options and has brought the following proposal to the fore:

- **A member not drawn from the EPA** shall be mandated to chair RTWG on an ad-hoc basis.
 - When the proposal for the establishment of a standalone forestry institution is duly accepted and such an institution is established, it will become the chair of the RTWG.
- 2) As per the comments of the TAP, the RTWG has made an amendment on table 15 (page 86), Action B.2 replacing “cash flow” by the more comprehensive concept of “financial management system”. Particular adjustments are made on the columns discussing “Gap/ Challenge Analysis”, “Action”, “Method”, “Outcome”
 - 3) The comments forwarded by the TAP regarding the need for a Carbon Registry is found valid by the RTWG. Accordingly, the group has included this as an action to be implemented under 2c (page 88 and 91), Monitoring and Evaluation Component (page 150) as well as the Schedule and Budget Component (Page 147).
 - 4) Further adjustment has also been made on the Action Plan Table (Table 15, Page 81-88) and the budget table (Table 16, Page 89-91)
 - 5) Regarding the institutional restructuring of forestry institution, this is already addressed on component 1a and on response no. 1 of this component
 - 6) The issue raised concerning the need for benefit sharing mechanism has been discussed on component 2a (page 51 of the main document).

Component 2d:

On Terms of reference for ESMF (Page 94), the following addition has been made

“...The forest regeneration through local community led area closure in northern Ethiopia first pioneered by the institute of sustainable development (ISD) and the bureau of agriculture of Tigray has been based on the respective community's wish for environmental rehabilitation coupled with improved socio-economic conditions as experienced by the by laws of each local community and thus integrate environmental and socio-economic dimensions...”

Minor adjustments has been done on the Action Plan (Table 17, Page 96-101), and on the corresponding budget (Table 18, Page 102)

Component 3: Reference Scenario

Response to reviewer's assessment of how well R-PP meets standard, and recommendations:

1. On page 103 a goal and objectives of the component added as follows;

Goal and Objectives

"The overall goal of this component is to develop a scenario for the reference level that projects emissions and removals of CO₂ into the future without REDD+ incentives."

The objectives of this component:

- "To Quantify historic emissions/ removals from deforestation and forest degradation to produce estimates of historic CO₂ emission levels for the proposed period post 2000 to 2010+ at a national and sub-national (National Regional States) scale, using the IPCC framework, and spatially represented to reflect differences; and
- To develop future trajectories of emissions/removals over different time periods and under different economic and development scenarios. This will take into consideration such factors as Ethiopia's Vision of developing a Carbon Neutral and Climate Resilient Economy in 2020."

2. On the baseline (page 103&104) the following is added:

"REDD+ baselines are essential as they provide a reference against which emissions performance can be assessed. There will be an informed decision whether REDD+ baselines /reference levels could be established either at the national accounting level and/or at the sub-national (including project-) accounting level. From an environmental perspective, the baseline accounting level has implications for carbon leakage. The analysis and the decision making process will therefore take into account compliance with the relevant international requirements set in connection with carbon leakage. In this connection Ethiopia needs to prepare guidelines or methodologies that aimed to promote co-benefits and climate benefits while avoiding leakage within its REDD+ system."

"The Reference Emission Levels at a Federal and national regional state levels are key elements to:

- i. Define and quantify the mitigation objectives that Ethiopia would like to reach through the Implementation of REDD+;
- ii. Measure the performance of REDD+ policies and actions. In doing so, Ethiopia will have to start to establish its national REL and RL. Once the national REL and RL will be defined and be approved by the UNFCCC, DRC will have start by defining a national strategy for REDD+ implementation according to possible and potential emission reduction and removals enhancement targets."

Ethiopia's Plan of Sustainable Development Trajectory

"Ethiopia is one of the least developed countries. However, its economic growth since 2003 has been averaging about 11% per year and now, because of its large population of over 80 million, it has the biggest economy in eastern Africa. Its plans are to double its present GDP by 2016. Of greater relevance in the present context, it has planned its economic growth to be based on renewable energy and thus to achieve a zero% net emission by 2025. In order to do this, it aims for tier 2 emission quantification by 2015 and a tier 3 by 2020. Between 2011 and 2015, it plans to develop the requisite human capacity and to try out using all available information and methodologies tier 2 emission estimates of all of its economic sectors."

3. On Levels of detail for estimating C stock changes (Page 104&105), minor adjustment has been done on Table 19, and the subsequent paragraph is adjusted as follows:

"...There is general consensus that only Approach 3 or tier 2, based on remote sensing techniques coupled with ground verification, will provide activity data of sufficient quality and that is why that Ethiopia aims at Tier level 2 for its emission factors by 2015. Ethiopia will thus go for a step-by-step inventory compilation."

4. The Forest Definition (page 105) has been replaced by the Agriculture, forestry and other land use (AFOLU) definition for Ethiopia; the following additions have been made:

Agriculture, forestry and other land use (AFOLU) definition for Ethiopia

"Though in the present context Ethiopia's aim is REDD+, its overall aim is to include all its economic sectors so as to achieve its 0% emission target by 2025. Therefore, REDD+ has to be seen as a component part of this overall aim."

".....There has not as yet been a measurement of all its grasslands and wetlands. This has to be done in the next few years. The extent of its agricultural land, though varying from year to year, is assessed annually by the Statistics agency."

On table 20 the following categories are added (Page 106):

"lowland grassland about 700 m.s.l	all the more or less treeless grassland (except where the alien invasive tree, <i>Prosopis juliflora</i> , has taken over), use of transhumant pastoralists mostly along the east (Afar and Somali Regions) and south (Oromia and Southern Region), but also along the west in Gambela, Beni-shangul Gumuz, Amhara and Tigray).
------------------------------------	---

High mountain grassland	Scattered in all the regions of the central highlands (Oromia, Southern Region, Amhara and Tigray), used by sedentary or semi-sedentary pastoralists
Rain fed agricultural lands, often with supplementary small-scale irrigation. irrigated large scale lowland agricultural land	Mostly along the Awash River in Oromia and Afar Regions, but expanding also to other regions."

5. Information on "Monitoring of drivers and activities" have been added making a link with "qualitative impact assessment of drivers and activities affecting deforestation and forest degradation" (Table 21, Page 106).

6. Information on "data quality" is added, also making a link with "Quality assessment of historical data sets" (Table 22, Page 108)

7. Table 21 with data of high forest area is added on page 110.

8. On Required data and implied capacity building (Page 115), the following paragraphs are added:

"New data from aerial photographs and ground verification at successive points in time are thus required for the ecologically and economically different component parts of the whole country so as to include all grasslands and wetlands and not be restricted to dealing only with forests and agricultural lands. Additional accuracy for the forests can be obtained by including the existing data in quantifying the reference emission levels and corresponding reference levels to quantify emissions and removals following methodologies recommended by the most recent IPCC report which, at the moment, are those of 2006.

In order to cover the impacts of agriculture and pastoralism as well as to monitor the carbon sequestering capacity of all types of land use, including forests, capacity for estimating soil carbon stocks and not only for estimating vegetation cover, is a prerequisite.

The ecological, economic and socio-cultural diversity of each of the administrative regions of the country is considerable and the diversity does not show only at the countrywide level. Therefore, each of the administrative regions has also to be

divided into distinct parts for the purpose of developing reference emission levels and reference levels. For these reasons, especially in the context of avoiding leakages, it will be necessary to treat an administrative region as if it were a distinct complex country, by identifying major land use changes/conversion in different national regional states and the country as a whole. Ethiopia will assess its historical data to assess REL and RL using RS data from 2000 to 2010. The justification for doing this is that starting from 2000 it is possible to use the most comprehensive satellite data sets at national scale. This choice should allow Ethiopia to have two-three data points of 5 years intervals to assess the historic trend in forest area extension.”

9. ON Capacity building and pilot projects (Page 16&117), the following is added:

“Besides the need for improved capacity on above ground land cover estimation, table 26 shows the total lack in Ethiopia of human capacity for soil carbon stock estimation. this capacity will have to be developed sufficiently not only for measuring to generate the data which will be the basis of, but also to review the quantities internally both before, and externally after, the reporting of emissions and removals by REDD+ and by the other economic sectors.”

10. The Terms of Reference for developing Reference Scenario (Page 117), has been rewritten completely. Accordingly, Table 27 (Page 121-124) the action plan and Table 28 (the budget) have been adjusted.

Component 4: MRV

1. The following paragraphs have been added on page 127:

“In order to participate in the REDD+ under the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC), Ethiopia must establish a system of measurement, reporting and verification (MRV) for Greenhouse Gas (GHGs) emissions, including GHGs from deforestation and forest degradation.”

“Even though Ethiopia is a least developed country, it will be happy with an international verification for those components for which it has received financial, technological and capacity-building support. Even for those components for which it has not received support, Ethiopia will welcome the verification of results, through, of course, the outcome of such verification will be used only for learning lessons from. These lessons will help it achieve its plan of achieving a 0% net emission by 2025.”

“The stakeholder discussions have decided that participatory monitoring and verification is the best approach for Ethiopia because it is participatory movements

that have so far managed to reverse deforestation and overgrazing while top-down decisions have always failed. A necessary consequence of the present decision is the need for the opening of all REDD+ activities, including domestic monitoring and verification, to the advisory role of international verification. Such an advisory verification will ensure transparency and objectivity, thus strengthening the participatory process.

2. On MRV system, the following is added (page 128):

Objectives and design

“The Change (UNFCCC), Ethiopia must establish a system of measurement, reporting and verification (MRV) for Greenhouse Gas (GHGs) emissions, including GHGs from deforestation, sustainable forest management and forest degradation.” Monitoring system will serve to monitor reduction of emissions resulting from deforestation and forest degradation; and the role conservation and sustainable management of forests as well as enhancement of forest carbon stocks.

The Ethiopia’s MRV system will enable the evaluation of anthropogenic emissions by sources and anthropogenic removals by GHG sinks resulting from activities relating to forestry. It will be developed in accordance with the 2006 Guidelines of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) for national inventories of GHGs.

On measurement: Ethiopia needs to have guidelines, rules and/or best practices to be followed when estimating the impacts of measures that reduce emissions from deforestation and forest degradation. These guidelines will be designed in conformity with the available relevant international instruments or practices.

On reporting: Ethiopia needs to have a standardized national reporting format, and/or common reporting guidelines outlining how actions are reported, e.g. which language, what units, what timing, where reports are collated/collected, what should be reported, and/or when reporting should take place.

On verification: Ethiopia needs to decide on who the verification body or bodies is/are; what the verification process should be, how results should be reported, and how to make any needed adjustments in reports of reducing emission from deforestation and forest degradation. There will also be clear decision on whether any verification issues should lead to consequences for the reporting regional state or bodies.”

3. On sampling methods (page 131):

“.....This will be done with caution, and we will deal with stratum and the mean of the stratum but not directly identify the exact point of the transect.”

“It should be pointed out, however, that much forest enhancement has taken place since the WBISPP project, especially in Northern Ethiopia, and this new forest area has to be studied during the implementation of the R-PP to verify the extent to which the WBISPP methodologies apply to it as well.”

“It should be noted, however, that much forest enhancement has occurred since the WBISPP was finalized. In any case, sampling for REDD+ monitoring will be used for prioritizing forest area for REDD+ support and thus the WBISPP plots will have a new variable added in choosing what to sample.”

4. Adjustment has been done on Table 33 (Page 132&133)

5. Co-benefits (page 134&135), the following paragraphs are added:

“Co-benefits: Although REDD is necessarily focused on addressing carbon emissions, the Bali Action Plan recognizes that actions to support REDD “can promote co-benefits and may contribute to achieving the aims and objectives of other relevant international conventions and agreements”. A notable example is that of the Convention on Biological Diversity. Addressing emissions from deforestation and forest degradation will have significant positive impacts on biodiversity since a decline in deforestation and degradation implies a decline in habitat destruction and thus in biodiversity loss. At the national and local scale, reducing emissions from deforestation and forest degradation in areas of both high carbon stocks and high biodiversity can contribute to climate benefits and further enhance co-benefits related to biodiversity conservation and sustainable use.

The REDD+ mechanism in Ethiopia will encompass conservation, sustainable forest management, and the enhancement of carbon stocks. This approach will have additional positive impacts on biodiversity, in particular since this will be achieved through the appropriate restoration of degraded forest ecosystems and forest landscapes. Afforestation and reforestation (A/R) activities that will be included in the REDD+ mechanism will provide incentives to regenerate forests in previously deforested areas.

Moreover, the use of mixed native forest species will be discouraged in order to yield multiple benefits for biodiversity. Safeguards will also be strictly applied to avoid potential adverse impacts on biodiversity likely to emanate from mono-plantations and the potential use of invasive alien species in plantations. The implementation phase will examine specific ways to promote co-benefits of REDD in order to maximise REDD+ implementation.

For instance, promoting or maximising biodiversity co-benefits may require targeting multiple ecosystem services by undertaking explicit cost-benefit analysis. The cost benefit analysis could involve identification of areas with high ecosystem services benefits, identification of areas of high risk of deforestation and degradation, evaluation of opportunity costs. Once these have been addressed, there will be a clear input that is needed necessary to develop the appropriate policies and incentives to capture and market the benefits of REDD+.

Identifying areas with high carbon benefits, as well as those with high co-benefits, requires tools to assess where these occur geographically and where they are spatially correlated. To ensure national ownership of any list of identified areas, this also requires a stakeholder and expert process, driven by government. A technical expert group will be established to develop best practice methods. Furthermore, identifying areas with high risks of deforestation and forest degradation will not result in the exclusion from eligibility of protected areas. This is because protected areas suffer from poor management, lack of adequate resources including for enforcement, which make them unable to adequately protect forest species and ecosystems."

6. Table 34 (Page 137&138) has been adjusted

7. The Terms of Reference for MRV (Page 140-142) has been rewritten; accordingly the action plan (Table 36, Page 143-145) and the budget (Table 37, Page 146) have been re-worked.

Component 5: Schedule and budget (Table 38, Page 147)

The Schedule and Budget table is completely re-adjusted

Component 6: Monitoring and evaluation

1. The following Paragraph has been added (Page 148):

"The Programme Monitoring and Evaluation of the REDD+ economic and environmental sector will help the Government of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia to continue evaluating the performance of the various economic sectors of the country in the way towards a sustainable carbon neutral development trajectory being achieved by 2025."

2. Baseline data generation is added in the M&E action plan (Table 39, page 149&150); Table 39 has been adjusted.

3. Key indicators are established for each major action of all components; a column is created indicators listed on each component action plan (see each action plan for each component)

4. The institutional mandates for M&E has been changed from NMA to RS&RTWG (page 149&150)

5. The methodology of SESA and ESMF is sufficiently discussed on Component 2d; indicators are established

4. An action has been inserted and budgeted earmarked for development of sound financial management system (page 150)